

Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing

English Language
Arts 30–1

From the June 2007 Diploma Examination

- Personal Response to Texts Assignment
- Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

This document was written primarily for:

Students	✓
Teachers	✓
Administrators	✓
Parents	✓
General Public	✓
Others	

Copyright 2007, the Crown in Right of Alberta, as represented by the Minister of Education, Alberta Education, Learner Assessment, 44 Capital Boulevard, 10044 108 Street NW, Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6, and its licensors. All rights reserved.

Special permission is granted to **Alberta educators only** to reproduce, for educational purposes and on a non-profit basis, parts of this document that do **not** contain excerpted material.

Excerpted material in this document **shall not** be reproduced without the written permission of the original publisher (see credits, where applicable).

Contents

Acknowledgements	ii
Introduction	1
English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007 Writing Assignments	3
Personal Response to Texts Assignment	4
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment	10
English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation	12
Background	12
Impressions from Standards Confirmation June 2007	13
Examples of Students’ Writing with Teachers’ Commentaries	15
English Language Arts 30–1 Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007	15
English Language Arts 30–1 Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007	61
Scoring Categories and Criteria	86

Acknowledgements

Publication of this document would not have been possible without the permission of the students whose writing is presented. The co-operation of these students has allowed us to continue illustrating the standards of writing performance expected in the context of diploma examinations and demonstrate the variety of approaches taken by students in their writing.

This document includes the valuable contributions of many educators. Sincere thanks and appreciation are extended to the following Standards Confirmers: Pam Davies, Gary Dogterom, Jeanette Footz, Jim Forrest, Bill Howe, Martha Howson, Paula Lee, Ric Noble, and Heather Wheatland.

We gratefully acknowledge the contributions made by members of the Humanities Unit and the Document Design and Desktop Publishing Unit of Learner Assessment, Alberta Education.

You can reach us with your comments and questions by e-mail to Barbara.Proctor-Hartley@gov.ab.ca, John.Finnie@gov.ab.ca, or Tim.Coates@gov.ab.ca,

or by regular mail at
Alberta Education
Box 43
44 Capital Boulevard
10044 108 Street NW
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6

We would be pleased to hear from you.

Introduction

The written responses in this document are examples of English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination writing that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), or Excellent (E). These sample responses are taken from the June 2007 administration. Along with the commentaries that accompany them, they should help you and your students to understand the standards for English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination writing in relation to the scoring criteria.

The purpose of the sample responses is to illustrate the standards that governed the June 2007 marking session and that anchor the selection of similar sample responses for subsequent marking sessions in 2007. The sample papers and the commentaries were used to train markers to apply the scoring criteria consistently and to justify their decisions about scores in terms of each student’s work and the criteria.

The sample responses included in this document represent a very small sample of successful approaches to the assignments.

Selection and Use of Sample Papers

The teachers on the Standards Confirmation Committee for the June 2007 marking session selected the examples of student responses included here. They also wrote the commentaries that discuss the students’ writing in terms of the scoring criteria used for marking.

During their preparation for the June 2007 marking session, markers reviewed and validated the standards represented by these sample responses. Markers then used these sample responses as guidelines for marking the written-response sections of the June 2007 English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination.

Cautions

1. The commentaries are brief.

The commentaries were written for groups of markers to discuss and apply during the marking session. Although brief, they provide a model for relating specific examples from student work to the details in a specific scoring criterion.

2. Neither the scoring guide nor the assignments are meant to limit students to a single organizational or rhetorical approach in completing any diploma examination assignment.

Students must be free to select and organize their materials in a manner that they feel will enable them to best present their ideas. In fact, part of what is being assessed is the final effectiveness of the content, the form and structure, and the rhetorical choices that students make.

The student-writing in this document illustrates *just a few of the many* successful organizational and rhetorical strategies used in June 2007.

We strongly recommend that you caution your students that there is *no preferred approach* to an assignment except the approach that best accomplishes the student writer's goal of effectively communicating his or her own ideas about the topic.

We advise you not to draw any conclusions about common patterns of approach taken by students.

3. The sample papers presented in this document must not be used as models for instructional purposes.

Because these papers are illustrations only, and because they are sample responses to a set topic, students must be cautioned not to memorize the content of any of these assignments or to use them when completing classroom assignments or when writing future diploma examinations.

The *approaches* taken by students at the *standard of excellence*, not their words or ideas, are what students being examined in the future should consider emulating. In fact, it is hoped that the variety of approaches presented here will inspire students to experiment with diction, syntax, and form and structure as a way of developing an individual voice and engaging the reader in ideas and forms that the student has considered.

Examination markers and staff at Alberta Education take any possibility of plagiarism or cheating seriously. The consequences for students are grave.

4. It is essential that you consider each of these examples of student writing in light of the constraints of the examination situation.

Under examination conditions, students produce *first-draft writing*. Given more time, students would be expected to produce papers of considerably improved quality, particularly in the dimensions of Presentation, Matters of Correctness, and Writing Skills.

- 5.** For further information regarding student performance on the Part A: Written Response, access the **English Language Arts 30–1 Assessment Highlights** for January and June 2007.
- 6.** Significant changes to the instructions to students' planning pages and the scoring criteria have been made to Part A: Written Response for January and June 2007. For an example of the new format and scoring criteria, access the 2006/2007 **English Language Arts 30–1 Information Bulletin**.

English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007 Writing Assignments

June 2007

English Language Arts 30–1

Part A: Written Response

Grade 12 Diploma Examination

Description

Time: 2½ hours. This examination was developed to be completed in 2½ hours; however, you may take an additional ½ hour to complete the examination.

Plan your time carefully.

Part A: Written Response contributes 50% of the total English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination mark and consists of two assignments.

- **Personal Response to Texts Assignment**
Value 20% of total examination mark
- **Critical /Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**
Value 30% of total examination mark

Recommendation: Read and reflect upon the whole examination before you begin to write. Time spent in planning may result in better writing.

Do not write your name anywhere in this booklet. Feel free to make corrections and revisions directly on your written work.

Instructions

- Complete the Personal Response to Texts Assignment first. The Personal Response to Texts Assignment is designed to allow you time to think and reflect upon the ideas that you may also explore in the Critical /Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment.
- Complete **both** assignments.
- You may use the following print references:
 - an English and/or bilingual dictionary
 - a thesaurus
 - an authorized writing handbook
- Space is provided in this booklet for planning and for your written work.
- Use blue or black ink for your written work.

Additional Instructions for Students Using Word Processors

- Format your work using an easy-to-read 12-point or larger font such as Times.
- Double-space your final copy.
- Staple your final printed work to the pages indicated for word-processed work for each assignment. Hand in all work.
- Indicate in the space provided on the back cover that you have attached word-processed pages.

PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes

Carefully read and consider the texts on pages 1 to 4, and then complete the assignment that follows.

DIARY OF A PIANO-TUNER'S WIFE

August, 1956

I want to let his garden die, at least
Encourage it to grow beyond itself
Until it's something that he doesn't know.
That's what our daughter did. She never calls.
It's been so long I wouldn't recognize
Her voice or how she looks or anything.

Today I dug the bed-row stones away
And made a pile of them beside the fence.
It had the look of Bible altars, built
When Moses led the Hebrews out of Egypt.
That's my kind of story, Exodus.
And when the lines of stone were pulled away,
I felt the shallow trenches where they lay,
Their mold and lichen grown in lacy patterns
Underneath the rocks and on the soil.
They were moist and pleasant to the touch
And made the labor almost effortless.
The waters of my world were parted then
As if to show me what a waste it is
That everything in life is made of lines.
When I had thrown his garden out of order,
It satisfied me like a difficult itch
I couldn't reach until I moved just right.

Maybe now I understand my husband
When he tries to scratch the arm he lost.
He wakes at night and swears he feels mosquitos
Biting on the arm that fertilized
A cubit-length of battlefield in France,
That brief embrace of lavender for which
I've been compelled to garden ever since.
It's such a mulish type of sentiment
That governs what a man will take to heart
So only meanness every now and then
Is strong enough to make him stop and feel.

Continued

He's out there now in someone else's house.
They'll serve him cake and coffee. I can see it.
He'll be pleasant, making conversation
While his custom-made prosthetic wrench
Is tightening the nuts of their piano,
Keeping the world in tune. That's what he
thinks.
And when he sees the pile of stones I made,
He'll try to set them back in lines again,
But just today I found my phantom limb,
And it was burning like a bush in Egypt.
Now I know, and so will he: I'm more
Than just another string he fails to tune.

Wilmer Mills

Mills, Wilmer. "Diary of a Piano-Tuner's Wife, August, 1956." In *Light for the Orphans*. Sewanee, Tenn.: Wood, Word, Wheat, 2003. ISBN 0-9746032-0-1.
Reproduced with permission from Wilmer Mills.

Waited



Clive Smith

Waited by Clive Smith. Courtesy Galerie de Bellefeuille. Reproduced with permission from Clive Smith.

PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes

from ANGELA'S ASHES

Mrs. Hannon tells my mother that John is getting worse every day, And what would you think, Mrs. McCourt, if your boy Frankie went on the float with him a few hours a week and helped him with the bags? We can barely afford it but Frankie could earn a shilling or two and John could rest his poor legs.

Mam says, I don't know, he's only eleven and he had that typhoid and the coal dust wouldn't be good for his eyes.

Bridey says, He'd be out in the air and there's nothing like fresh air for someone with bad eyes or getting over the typhoid, isn't that right, Frankie?

'Tis, Bridey.

I'm dying to go around with Mr. Hannon on the great float like a real workingman. If I'm good at it they might let me stay at home from school forever but Mam says, He can do it as long as it doesn't interfere with school and he can start on a Saturday morning.

I'm a man now so I light the fire early on Saturday morning and make my own tea and fried bread. I wait next door for Mr. Hannon to come out with his bicycle and there's a lovely smell of rashers and eggs coming through the window. Mam says Mr. Hannon gets the best of food because Mrs. Hannon is as mad about him as she was the day she married him. They're like two lovers out of an American film the way they go on. Here he is pushing the bicycle and puffing away on the pipe in his mouth. He tells me climb up on the bar of his bike and off we go to my first job as a man. His head is over mine on the bike and the smell of the pipe is lovely. There's a coal smell on his clothes and that makes me sneeze.

Men are walking or cycling toward the coal yards and Rank's Flour Mills and the Limerick Steamship Company on the Dock Road. Mr. Hannon takes his pipe from his mouth and tells me this is the best morning of all, Saturday, half day. We'll start at eight and be finished by the time the Angelus rings at twelve.

First we get the horse ready, give him a bit of a rub, fill the wooden tub with oats and the bucket with water. Mr. Hannon shows me how to put on the harness and lets me back the horse into the shafts of the float. He says, Jaysus, Frankie, you have the knack of it.

That makes me so happy I want to jump up and down and drive a float the rest of my life.

There are two men filling bags with coal and turf and weighing them on the great iron scale, a hundredweight¹ in each bag. It's their job to stack the bags on the float while Mr. Hannon goes to the office for the delivery dockets. The bag men are fast and we're ready for our rounds. Mr. Hannon sits up on the left side of the float and flicks the whip to show where I'm to sit on the right side. It's hard to climb up the way the float is so high and packed with bags and I try to get up by climbing the wheel. Mr. Hannon says I

Continued

¹hundredweight—50 kilograms

Reprinted with permission of Scribner, an imprint of Simon & Schuster Adult Publishing Group, from ANGELA'S ASHES by Frank McCourt. Copyright © 1996 by Frank McCourt. All rights reserved.

should never do the likes of that again. Never put your leg or hand near a wheel when the horse is harnessed in the shafts. A horse might take a notion to go for a walk for himself and there you are with the leg or the arm caught in the wheel and twisted off your body and you looking at it. He says to the horse, G'up ower that, and the horse shakes his head and rattles the harness and Mr. Hannon laughs. That fool of a horse loves to work, he says. He won't be rattling his harness in a few hours.

When the rain starts we cover ourselves with old coal bags and Mr. Hannon turns his pipe upside down in his mouth to keep the tobacco dry. He says the rain makes everything heavier but what's the use of complaining. You might as well complain about the sun in Africa.

We cross the Sarsfield Bridge for deliveries to the Ennis Road and the North Circular Road. Rich people, says Mr. Hannon, and very slow to put their hands in their pockets for a tip.

We have sixteen bags to deliver. Mr. Hannon says we're lucky today because some houses get more than one and he doesn't have to be climbing on and off that float destroying his legs. When we stop he gets down and I pull the bag to the edge and lay it on his shoulders. Some houses have areas outside where you pull up a trap door and tip the bag till it empties and that's easy. There are other houses with long backyards and you can see Mr. Hannon suffering with his legs when he has to carry the bags from the float to the sheds near the back doors. Ah, Jaysus, Frankie, ah, Jaysus, is the only complaint out of him and he asks me to give him a hand to climb back on the float. He says if he had a handcart he could wheel the bags from float to house and that would be a blessing but a handcart would cost two weeks' wages and who could afford that?

The bags are delivered and the sun is out, the float is empty, and the horse knows his workday is over. It's lovely to sit on the float looking along the length of the horse from his tail to his head rocking along the Ennis Road over the Shannon and up the Dock Road. Mr. Hannon says the man who delivered sixteen hundredweights of coal and turf deserves a pint and the boy who helped him deserves a lemonade. He tells me I should go to school and not be like him working away with the two legs rotting under him. Go to school, Frankie, and get out of Limerick and Ireland itself. This war will be over some day and you can go to America or Australia or any big open country where you can look up and see no end to the land. The world is wide and you can have great adventures. If I didn't have these two legs I'd be over in England making a fortune in the factories like the rest of the Irishmen, like your father. No, not like your father. I hear he left you high and dry, eh? I don't know how a man in his right mind can go off and leave a wife and family to starve and shiver in a Limerick winter. School, Frankie, school. The books, the books, the books. Get out of Limerick before your legs rot and your mind collapses entirely. . . .

On the way home I see myself in the glass of a shop window all black from the coal, and I feel like a man, a man with a shilling in his pocket, a man who had a lemonade in a pub with two coal men and a lime man. I'm not a child anymore and I could easily leave Leamy's School forever. I could work with Mr. Hannon every day and when his legs got too bad I could take over the float and deliver coal to the rich people the rest of my life and my mother wouldn't have to be a beggar at the Redemptorist priests' house.

Frank McCourt

PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes

You have been provided with three texts on pages 1 to 4. In Wilmer Mills' poem "Diary of a Piano-Tuner's Wife," the speaker expresses her refusal to be constrained by her circumstances. In Clive Smith's painting *Waited*, the youth has yet to emerge from beneath the carpet. In an excerpt from the memoir *Angela's Ashes*, Frank McCourt recounts a time when he was encouraged to resist being satisfied with what was familiar.

The Assignment

What do these texts suggest to you about an individual's response to the constraints of convention or circumstance? Support your idea(s) with reference to one or more of the texts presented and to your previous knowledge and/or experience.

In your writing, you must

- use a prose form
- connect one or more of the texts provided in this examination to your own ideas and impressions

CRITICAL / ANALYTICAL RESPONSE TO LITERARY TEXTS ASSIGNMENT
Suggested time: approximately 1½ to 2 hours

For this assignment, you must focus your discussion on a literary text or texts *other than* the texts provided in this examination booklet.

The Assignment

Consider how an individual’s response to conventions or circumstances has been reflected and developed in a literary text you have studied in English Language Arts 30–1. Discuss the idea(s) developed by the text creator in your chosen text about the significance of an individual’s attempt to live unconstrained by convention or circumstance.

In your planning and writing, consider the following instructions.

- When considering the works that you know well, select a literary text meaningful to you and relevant to this assignment.
- Carefully consider your *controlling idea* or how you will create a strong *unifying effect* in your response.
- As you develop your ideas, support them with appropriate, relevant, and meaningful examples from your choice of literary text(s).

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text

Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

Additional space is provided for *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text* on page 18.

English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation

Background

For all diploma examination scoring sessions, Learner Assessment staff use a process of standards confirmation to establish and illustrate expectations for students' work in relation to the scoring criteria and to ensure scoring consistency within and between marking sessions. Because there are several diploma examination administrations and scoring sessions each school year, the standards must remain consistent for each scoring session in the school year and, similarly, from year to year.

Standards for student achievement start with both the demands of the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts and the interpretation of those demands through learning resources and classroom instruction. These agreed-upon standards are also exemplified in the kinds of tasks and the degree of independence expected of students. All these complex applications of standards precede the design, development, and scoring of each diploma examination.

The Standards Confirmation Committee is composed of experienced teachers from representative regions of the province. These teachers work with the Learner Assessment staff responsible for the development, scoring, and results-reporting for each diploma examination. Teacher-members participate over a two-year period and are required to serve as group leaders or markers during at least one of the subsequent marking sessions.

There are two essential parts to applying standards at the point of examination scoring: the expectations embedded in the scoring criteria and the examples of students' work that illustrate the scoring criteria within each scoring category. The scoring categories and scoring criteria are available to teachers and students via the 2006/2007 English Language Arts 30–1 Information Bulletin. During each of the January and June marking sessions, example papers selected by members of the Standards Confirmation Committee are used to train markers. Subsequent to each marking session, the example papers that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), and Excellent (E) are posted on the Alberta Education web site at www.education.gov.ab.ca in the documents entitled Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing.

During the standards confirmation process,

- the appropriateness of the standards set by the examination in relation to students' work is confirmed
- student responses that clearly illustrate the standards in the scoring categories and the scoring criteria are selected and are used when training markers
- rationales that explain and support the selection of sample papers in terms of the scoring categories, scoring criteria, and students' work are written

Impressions from Standards Confirmation June 2007

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Preparing to Mark

- When marking a response, markers consciously return to the **Focus** section of the scoring criteria to reorient themselves to the distinction between the two scoring categories. Markers take care to read the students' comments in the **Initial Planning** section, wherein students might indicate their reasoning and intention in choosing a particular prose form.
- Markers review the texts provided in the assignment and reread the prompt and assignment at the start of each marking day. Markers expect that the students' ideas and impressions are informed by the details within the text(s) and the contextual information presented in the preamble. Standards Confirmers found that many students employed greater specificity when using details from the text(s) or, alternatively, when "fleshing out" the text(s) with their own imaginative details.

Choice of Prose Form

- Standards Confirmers observed that many students have developed more confidence in dealing with the strengths and constraints of different prose forms and have often opted to use explicit reference to a text or texts within a creative response. When the markers considered the student's creation of **voice**, the focus was on "the context created by the student in the chosen prose form." Markers also carefully considered the effectiveness of "the student's development of a **unifying effect**." These distinctions are especially significant when assessing creative responses.

Explicit Reference to Text

- Standards Confirmers found that students making explicit references to the texts did so with varying degrees of plausibility relative to the historical context established in the response, and that imaginative details that may not have accurately reflected historical fact were understandable. Frequently, markers recognized that, with varying degrees of originality, the fiction created by the student paralleled one or more of the texts provided. Similarity between the premise for the narrative or the student's personal experience and the other texts was understandable given classroom practice and the nature of the assignment.

Implicit Reference to Text

- As in the past, some students did not explicitly support their ideas "with reference to one or more of the texts presented." In some responses, an obvious parallel to the text(s) was apparent, whereas in others, an implicit understanding of and connection to the text(s) was evident in the presentation of ideas. The student's exploration of ideas and impressions, however, must address the question in the assignment, and

markers must be able to identify the student's inferences and the implicit relationship between the topic, the texts, and the student's ideas and support. Standards Confirmers observed that, with varying degrees of success, students have found creative ways of *explicitly* representing the relationship linking topic, text reference, and ideas regardless of the chosen prose form. Standards Confirmers suggested that markers might occasionally need to read a student's work more than once to appreciate what a student has attempted and, in fact, accomplished.

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

- In the Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, students employed a number of approaches to fulfill the assignment. The assignment demanded that students choose their literature judiciously to address the ideas that the text creators develop regarding “the significance of an individual’s attempt to live unconstrained by convention or circumstances.” Students chose from a wide variety of literary texts, including film, to support their ideas. Where students elected to use more than one text, Standards Confirmers noted that students did so with varying degrees of familiarity and specificity. In these, as in all cases, markers considered the student’s treatment of the texts, the selection and quality of evidence, and how well that evidence was integrated and developed to support the student’s ideas.
- Standards Confirmers observed that most students considered the implications of the full assignment and demonstrated an understanding of the significance of an individual’s attempt to live unconstrained by convention or circumstances. Some students appropriately used a creative approach to organize and express their ideas in a critical and/or analytical manner.

Reminders for Markers

- Check for the literary text(s) selection in the Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment *before* beginning to mark the paper, especially given the increasing number of new texts appearing in student responses in the examination. Students assume that markers have recently taught the literary text(s).
- Markers must consider the student’s comments presented in the Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s) when assessing the scoring category of Supporting Evidence. Some students reveal thoughtful awareness of their purpose in choosing a particular text.

Examples of Students' Writing with Teachers' Commentaries

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Initial Planning

Your initial planning will assist markers in identifying the text or texts to which you are responding.

For each text you will reference, briefly identify the central idea that is most relevant to what you intend to explore.

Frankie is satisfied with coal delivery because of his current living state. And it is a new beginning for him.

response to constraints of circumstance.

Briefly identify what idea you intend to explore.

~~individuals~~ changing from hard working coal boy to a banker in his adult hood. looking back on how his perception changed.

State your choice of prose form. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do not use a poetic form.

Journal entries, using past and present ~~time~~ use two different time periods to strengthen the theme and main ideas.

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

*If you are using a word processor, staple your Personal Response here.
You may make corrections directly on your printed page(s).*

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Written Work

August 4th, 1914:

Today I went to work with Mr. Hannon, delivering coal to the houses. I had to wake up earlier than the rest of my family and make my own breakfast. It felt good knowing that I was old enough to fend for myself, free of my dependence for my mother. I was my own man now, like all the other men that worked for the companies in town. Delivering coal with Mr. Hannon was a tough job, my arms got tired from lifting those bags all day. I think I did all right though. The pay for a days work is one shilling, enough to support my mother so she wouldn't have to beg anymore. I could even quit school and work with Mr. Hannon everyday, I think I could handle that. I told Mr. Hannon this but he told me not to stop going to school. He says it's well worth it to exercise my mind and become

(Page 2 of 4)

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

well educated. I could go ~~to~~ a lot farther in life he said. Maybe he's right, but I like being able to work and make money. I wouldn't mind delivering coal for the rest of my life.

November 21st, 1949:

When I was flipping through an old family album today, I noticed a picture from about thirty five years ago. It was me and Mr. Hannon, posing with bags of coal, covered in black soot. It caused me to think back, when I was about eleven, when I began to get my first taste of the real world. Packing coal from house to house was a strenuous and dirty job, and the low wages didn't help it. At the time, though, it was all I knew, and to me it was the greatest thing ever. Maybe if I hadn't have listened to Mr. Hannon's advice I would~~be~~ still be there, destroying my body for a shilling a day. I hated school, but now that I ^{have} learned accounting and studied economics I ~~had~~ ~~the~~ ~~required~~ have the required

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

skills and knowledge to maintain my own bank. Because of this, I am making a good income to support my family. It makes me laugh now, looking back on that. I realize now ~~if~~ it wasn't that great, and heeding the ~~was~~ wisdom of Mr. Hannon actually paid off. It was ~~my~~ the anxiousness of my youth, and my ignorance of reality, that made me think that I had it made.

(Page 4 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (S)</p> <p>The student’s exploration of the topic is generalized.</p> <p>Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant.</p> <p>Support is adequate and clarifies the student’s ideas and impressions.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p>	<p>The contrast between the past and present in the two journal entries suggests some sophistication in the student’s approach to both the topic and the use of genre; however, the student’s attempt remains a generalized exploration of the topic. The first journal entry is primarily a paraphrasing of the excerpt with straightforward perceptions and relevant ideas about the nature of coal delivery work and the rewards associated with the pay. The second journal entry attempts a reality based perspective of an adult re-considering the naivety of his youthful views about the apparent advantages of manual labour compared to the real opportunities offered through education and a career in banking. Frankie’s realization that “heeding the wisdom of Mr. Hannon actually paid off” remains generalized as no context is provided for the abrupt shift in his understanding.</p> <p>The perception that the pay is “enough to support my mother so she wouldn’t have to beg anymore” is a straightforward explanation for the relevant idea that “I think I could handle” quitting school and working “with Mr. Hannon everyday.” The student uses adequate support from the excerpt in the first journal entry with adequate imaginative details in the second journal entry to clarify his decision to study “accounting” and “economics” instead of “delivering coal for the rest of my life.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Presentation (S)</p> <p>The voice created by the student is apparent. Stylistic choices are adequate and the student’s creation of tone is conventional. The unifying effect is appropriately developed.</p> <p align="center">S</p>	<p>Stylistic choices such as “He says it’s well worth it to excersise my mind and become well educated. I could go a lot farther in life he said” and “Packing coal from house to house was a strennuous and dirty job, and the low wages didn’t help it” are adequate and create a conventional tone. Despite the shift in thirty-five years from the first to the second journal entry, the narrative voice remains the same but it is apparent.</p> <p>The student’s presentation of the childhood experience in the first journal entry is balanced by the adult reflection in the second journal entry. The concluding thought that “It was the anxiousness of my youth, and my ignorance of reality, that made me think that I had it made” creates a unifying effect that is appropriately developed.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Initial Planning

Your initial planning will assist markers in identifying the text or texts to which you are responding.

For each text you will reference, briefly identify the central idea that is most relevant to what you intend to explore.

Briefly identify what idea you intend to explore.

State your choice of prose form. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do not use a poetic form.

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

When I first set my eyes on the painting entitled "Waited", I knew I could relate to the person in the image. Indeed, the portrait of a girl sitting on the floor, half covered by an ugly brown carpet, brought many memories to my mind. Her distraught look struck a chord in me, and I knew I had felt the same way in the past. The circumstances surrounding the recent years of my life had led me to take much the same expression as the girl in the painting.

I spent almost the totality of my youth in Montreal. My parents had work there, and it felt like home to me. Every summer, we would take a month off to go visit my family in Alberta. In fact, my parents were both native Albertans. Throughout my childhood, they had often talked about moving "back home", but I never thought the plan would materialize. It always felt like it was their fantasy, something that they would always talk about, but that they would never actually do.

However, a little more than a year ago, my mother lost her job. After that, the decision was quick; they were going to move to Alberta, and I was coming with them.

The whole suddenness of the decision threw me off guard. I had not expected this to happen, and I had not planned ahead. I did not want to move to Alberta. My friends were in Montreal, my life was in Montreal, and my heart was in Montreal. However, I did not have enough money to move out, which I gladly would have

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

done. Essentially, I had no choice but to follow my parents until I was old enough and had saved up enough to live on my own.

Often, I wonder what would have happened if they had waited a year or two. I probably could have stayed in Montreal. Alas, I was defeated by the circumstances of the moment and I was left helpless, staring at the floor with the same sad look as the girl in the Clive Smith painting.

Even now, it still feels as if I left my heart in Montreal. I'm hoping I'll be able to move back there in a year. Montreal is my home, and I think it will stay that way for the rest of my life, much the same way my parents never felt like Montreal was home. When I look back, I find it funny how I didn't realise how much I was leaving behind until I had turned my back to everyone and everything I had known since my childhood. The circumstances of my departure left me feeling bitter and unwilling to start all over again.

However, my bitterness and resentment were purely self-destructive. Instead of enjoying my first few months in Alberta, I spent them thinking about how my life would be had I not moved. I wasted precious months of my life, and I will never get them back.

This experience has taught me that it is important not to dwell on dreadful and unavoidable circumstances in my life, because reflecting on them and resenting

(Page 3 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007**

Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

them can only bring you bitterness and sadness. In order to be happy, one must ignore the constraints of circumstance and move on, making the most out of every moment. I learnt it the hard way.

(Page 4 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (Pf)</p> <p>The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful. Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;">Pf</p>	<p>The student purposefully uses the painting <i>Waited</i> and a personal anecdote of being bitter and resentful about a forced move to Alberta to lead to the ultimate realization that “In order to be happy, one must ignore the constraints of circumstance and move on.” On viewing the painting, the student realizes that the girl’s “distraught look struck a chord” and that the student too had to learn “it the hard way.”</p> <p>The student’s thoughtful perception “I was defeated by the circumstances of the moment and I was left helpless” leads to the considered ideas that “my bitterness and resentment were purely self-destructive” and “I wasted precious months of my life.” As well, the student draws a considered parallel to the student’s parents with “Montreal is my home, and I think it will stay that way for the rest of my life, much the same way my parents never felt like Montreal was home.”</p> <p>The student provides specific support by clearly understanding the constraints that were faced – “I did not have enough money to move out” and “I had no choice but to follow my parents until I was old enough and had saved up enough to live on my own.” The idea is strengthened further with “Instead of enjoying my first few months in Alberta, I spent them thinking about how my life would be had I not moved.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p align="center">Presentation (Pf)</p> <p>The voice created by the student is distinct.</p> <p>Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent.</p> <p>The unifying effect is capably developed.</p> <p align="center">Pf</p>	<p>The student creates a distinct voice in such statements as “I never thought the plan would materialize. It always felt like it was their fantasy.” As well, the student’s voice is well-defined in the recognition of the connection between the painting and the student’s experience: “I was defeated by the circumstances of the moment and I was left helpless, staring at the floor with the same sad look as the girl in the Clive Smith painting.”</p> <p>Stylistic choices are specific and further enhance this distinctive voice. For example, the syntax is varied and skilfully woven in “After that, the decision was quick; they were going to move to Alberta, and I was coming with them” and “I did not want to move to Alberta. My friends were in Montreal, my life was in Montreal, and my heart was in Montreal.” The student’s creation of tone is competent as in “it is important not to dwell on dreadful and unavoidable circumstances.”</p> <p>The student capably develops the unifying effect by detailing the conflicting personal responses to the constraints of circumstance and by finally drawing the conclusion that “In order to be happy, one must ignore the constraints of circumstance and move on, making the most out of every moment. I learnt it the hard way.”</p>

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Initial Planning

Your initial planning will assist markers in identifying the text or texts to which you are responding.

For each text you will reference, briefly identify the central idea that is most relevant to what you intend to explore.

the mass of men lead lives of quiet desperation
becoming something more than you are
breaking free of your monotonous life
Doing exactly what you want despite the circumstances

Briefly identify what idea you intend to explore.

breaking free from a monotonous life
becoming something more
Doing what you want despite the circumstances

State your choice of prose form. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do not use a poetic form.

creative - narrative

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

*If you are using a word processor, staple your Personal Response here.
You may make corrections directly on your printed page(s).*

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Anonymous

Written Work

I have been playing guitar since I was eleven, but no one here at Greenview Highschool knows about it. That's because I never found the courage to tell anybody. There was other kids around the school who were known for being musicians, they played at school concerts and talent shows. I knew that I could probably play better than most of these 'musicians' but I never said a word.

See, my friends do not really approve of those types of kids that play guitar. Sometimes they even make fun of them at lunch hour, laughing contagiously in their big circle of friends. I just smile and nod politely, I don't think I'm ever going to tell them. The idea in itself of showing them that side of me seems impossible. But then I stop and think about Andy Glasdale.

Andy Glasdale was widely known as a nerd around Greenview. He was one of those kids that nobody really knew about, but if you pointed him out in a crowd you would say, "Oh yeah, he's a nerd."

(Page 2 of 5)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

Written Work

Andy wore the same brown sweatshirt every day, along with sweatpants or kakis. He rotated between sweatpants and kakis. I always saw Andy doing the same thing every day. He would get to school a good twenty minutes early and head straight for the library. He would sit at the far table alone and read, or do his homework. He arrived at all of his classes early. He didn't talk to the teachers, he didn't talk to the students, he didn't talk to anyone. After school Andy left right away and that was it. I saw him repeating this invisible schedule over and over again wondering if he ever wanted something more.

A Tuesday morning in late May, Mr. Wessmier came over the P.A.

"Students, there will be a mandatory newspaper meeting in room 233 at lunch time. Newspaper is a new club we're starting here at Greenview so I want to see you all come out to support it." His nasally voice clicked off and the students resumed their casual chatter. Of course no one would have remembered this announcement if not a week later when Mr. Wessmier came on the P.A. once more,

(Page 3 of 5)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

“Students, newspaper is desperate for writers, we strongly urge you to submit your work to the school email or else this club will be cancelled.”

More days passed. Saudia Dhab in my English class said the situation was grim. Nobody had submitted, newspaper would have to be cancelled.

And then one day, hope. Saudia sprang into English class holding a paper. She passed it around. “Why this school is a Joke,” was the title of the paper.

“It was submitted last night,” Saudia exclaimed enthusiastically, “it’s brilliantly written. The whole thing criticizes the structure of highschool and the rules we are supposed to follow. It’s hilarious, and true.”

“Who wrote it?” Karen Pelowski asked.

“It doesn’t say. All it says is ~~Anonomys~~ Anonymous.” said Saudia, confusion written on her face.

So the newspaper was printed as a one page editorial. Saudia was pretty sure nobody would read it, but news of the article spread like wild fire and soon most of the student population had read it. It was controversial and caused unrest among the administrators.

(Page 4 of 5)

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

"The writer of the article 'Why this school is a joke' ~~is~~ report to the office immediately," Mr. ~~is~~ Wessmier announced on Monday. Administration told Saudia to stop the printing of articles like this, but she replied it was the only thing submitted. And just like that every week a new article was submitted. Each one more controversial, satirical and humorous than the next. Every ~~one~~ one was submitted by the same "Anonymous."

Everyone in the school was picking up these articles to read, everyone speculating over who 'Anonymous' could be. Some even taking credit for the articles, but always with false reward.

Eventually Mr. Wessmier came on the P.A and announced that newspaper would be cancelled. The students were disappointed and Saudia was mad but everyone knew it wasn't the end of the world.

The next day I came to school early and there walking through the halls was Andy Glasdale. He was not in the library. He had a different look to him. His face warm and calm. He wore blue jeans and a red shirt. He smiled at me and I smiled back. I turned to look as he walked away and in small white print on the back of his t-shirt it read: 'Anonymous.'

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–2

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (Pf)</p> <p>The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful. Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;">Pf</p>	<p>The student creates, as a prose form, a first-person narrative based on implicit reference to the texts in order to explore purposefully the importance of breaking free from convention. The student establishes the context by using a personal anecdote, “I have been playing guitar since I was eleven, but no one here at Greenview Highschool knows about it” which leads to the story of a “nerd” who breaks free of his reclusive nature because of the surrounding circumstances.</p> <p>The student develops the narrative with thoughtful and considered perceptions by confessing, “That’s because I never found the courage to tell anybody,” “Sometimes they even make fun of them at lunch hour, laughing contagiously in their big circle of friends,” and “The idea in itself of showing them that side of me seems impossible.”</p> <p>The support found in “Andy wore the same brown sweatshirt every day, along with sweatpants or kakis,” “He didn’t talk to the teachers, he didn’t talk to the students, he didn’t talk to anyone,” and “His [Mr. Wessmier’s] nasally voice clicked off and the students resumed their casual chatter” is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–2

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p style="text-align: center;">Pf</p> <p>Presentation (Pf)</p> <p>The voice created by the student is distinct.</p> <p>Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent.</p> <p>The unifying effect is capably developed.</p>	<p>The student creates the distinctive voice of a high school student feeling constrained by conventions in “I knew that I could probably play better than most of these ‘musicians’ but I never said a word” and “See, my friends do not really approve of those types of kids that play guitar.”</p> <p>Stylistic choices are specific as in, “I saw him [Andy] repeating this invisible schedule over and over again wondering if he ever wanted something more,” “And just like that every week a new article was submitted. Each one more controversial, satirical and humorous than the next,” and “Some even taking credit for the articles, but always with false reward.” The student creates a competent tone in such lines as “More days passed. Saudia Dhah in my English class said the situation was grim.”</p> <p>The unifying effect is capably developed through Andy’s growth from an introverted loner, “He would get to school a good twenty minutes early and head straight for the library. He would sit at the far table alone and read, or do his homework,” to an energized and engaged figure, “The next day I came to school early and there walking through the halls was Andy Glasdale. He was not in the library. He had a different look to him.” In addition, the student writer capably unifies the narrative initially through the title, then through the mystery of “‘Who wrote it?’ Karen Pelowski asked. ‘It doesn’t say. All it says is Anonymous,’” and finally through the revelation that, “I turned to look as he walked away and in small white print on the back of his t-shirt it read: ‘Anonymous.’”</p>

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Initial Planning

Your initial planning will assist markers in identifying the text or texts to which you are responding.

For each text you will reference, briefly identify the central idea that is most relevant to what you intend to explore.

Diary of a Piano-Tuner's wife: construction of a world of rigidity and order; an unnaturalness that fetters. The wife, in her liberation is passionate and dramatic, no longer stifled by her husband.

Briefly identify what idea you intend to explore.

Lack of fulfillment when bound by convention. Entrapment and its counterpart, escapism—being perpetually linked to one another in any form they can manifest.

State your choice of prose form. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do not use a poetic form.

Analytical Essay

(Page 1 of 4)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

*If you are using a word processor, staple your Personal Response here.
You may make corrections directly on your printed page(s).*

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Written Work

The topic immediately speaks to me, being a reflection of my life up until this point. In general terms, the natural response to entrapment is resistance. Even the ways of the world demand this — for every force, there is an equal but opposite force working against it. But the issue at hand is not what a person does, as intentions do not make the world go round; the issue at hand is the freedom from and the freedom to something.

The piano tuner's wife speaks against the life her husband leads, but impresses on his tendency of forcing the rigidity onto her. She feels stifled, and we can see this in her speech. Her liberation is compared not only to the sanctity of biblical ~~fant~~ stories, but also to the story of liberation from slavery. She makes the comparison to the garden, wishing it to grow out of control. Obviously, she is using it to vicariously escape her confines, but also to promote the natural way of things. She can offer freedom to, as she possesses little freedom from, and she feels that the overgrown garden, a mixture of life and death is much more natural. This obviously has a connection with her own self, but she also feels a link between it and her husband. The mixture of life and death, of course, being the repressed war scars he lives to ignore. He defies circumstance

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

Written Work

with his own form of convention — his career, and his know-nothing perfectionism, in contrast with his missing limb. This too, fails to please the wife though she seeks similar ~~as~~ ways out. Both characters have fallen into the trap of droning, but the wife is determined to live otherwise.

That is a situation true, I believe, to many people. We grow up with expectations, both from the people we know, and from the naturally structured social mores in which we find ourselves. We have dreams from when we are conscious enough to forge them, and my own dreams have grown ~~to~~ to look steadily less dreamlike. At one point, I vaguely recall having wanted to travel the world beyond the confines of that ~~gasp~~ blue thing we call the sky. But the nature of my upbringing and the rigidity of my education (personally being a very science and logic oriented person) seems to have wadded that ^{aspiration} into a simple white collar job.

I probably relate more closely to the piano tuner than his wife. I replace circumstance with another form of circumstance. I delude myself into contentment that way. But I suppose I feel some sort of vague connection with the wife too. To clarify, I do seek fulfillment in changes and I cannot stand a monotony for extended periods of time. But I fail to sense any inkling of freedom or par

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

Written Work

with Moses and his people. That takes a daring that, while
possessed by many, I lack by some coincidence or
design.

(Page 4 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (E)</p> <p>The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>The idea that “the natural response to entrapment is resistance” is explored insightfully in the comparison and contrast of the piano tuner’s wife and the student. The piano tuner’s wife finds the strength to resist her husband’s imposed “rigidity”, but the student actually “relates more closely to the piano tuner than his wife.”</p> <p>The confident assertion that “The topic immediately speaks to me, being a reflection of my life up until this point” initiates a discerning analysis of both the poem and the student’s experience, evident in perceptions such as “Obviously, she is using it [the garden] to vicariously escape her confines, but also to promote the natural way of things” and “But the nature of my upbringing and the rigidity of my education (personally being a very science and logic oriented person) seems to have widdled that aspiration into a simple white collar job.”</p> <p>Support such as, “Her liberation is compared not only to the sanctity of biblical stories, but also to the story of liberation from slavery” and “At one point, I vaguely recall having wanted to travel the world beyond the confines of that gaseous blue thing we call the sky” aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Presentation (E)</p> <p>The voice created by the student is convincing.</p> <p>Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept.</p> <p>The unifying effect is skillfully developed.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>The student’s reflective voice as evident in “We grow up with expectations, both from the people we know, and from the naturally structured social mores in which we find ourselves” is convincing in linking the poem to the student’s experiences.</p> <p>Stylistic choices, as demonstrated in “He defies circumstance with his own form of convention – his career, and his knowing perfectionism in contrast with his missing limb” and “But I fail to sense any inkling of freedom on par with Moses and his people” are precise. The student’s adept creation of tone is shown in “But the issue at hand is not what a person does, as intentions do not make the world go round; the issue at hand is the freedom from and the freedom to something.”</p> <p>The unifying effect, which is based on a connection between the poem’s characters and the student, is skillfully developed and concluded with the recognition that “I do seek fulfillment in changes” but a Moses-like exodus “takes a daring that, while possessed by many, I lack by some coincidence or design.”</p>

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

Initial Planning

Your initial planning will assist markers in identifying the text or texts to which you are responding.

For each text you will reference, briefly identify the central idea that is most relevant to what you intend to explore.

excerpt from Angel's Ashes - the men are horses, the boy is young, fresh, and eager, Mr. Hannon is older, wiser, and regretful, Frankie's father discovered the constraints and fled - but this caused the crippling of his family.

Briefly identify what idea you intend to explore.

Initially an individual does not view his circumstance as a constraint but comes to realize it with experience.

State your choice of prose form. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do not use a poetic form.

narrative

(Page 1 of 6)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

Planning

With experience, an individual begins to view his circumstances as a constraint. They will wish to escape it, but they cannot without a cost.

Horses - perspective

↳ Frankie

↳ "That fool of a horse loves to work" "He won't be rattling his harness in a few hours"

↳ riding a bike, smell of pipe is lovely = get the horse ready, give him a rub, oats, water

↳ Mr. Hannon

↳ has already been buckled by his circumstance, would leave if his legs weren't so degraded.

↳ Frankie's father

↳ left a wife and family to starve in order to make a fortune in England.

↳ "A horse might take a notion to go for a walk for himself and there you are with the leg or the arm caught in the wheel and twisted off your body with you looking at it..."

rain → makes everything heavier → tears → heaven weeping

coal → coal dust isn't good for his eyes

↳ clouds his vision

↳ masks the truth

→ pressing upon them

→ breaking down Mr. Hannon's legs

→ circumstance will break you

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

*If you are using a word processor, staple your Personal Response here.
You may make corrections directly on your printed page(s).*

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Coal Dust
Written Work

The rain falls upon my back, ~~big~~ huge heavy tears soaking through to my skin. The tears of God perhaps, ~~so~~ weeping for the foolishness and hardship of his creation. This knowledge more than anything is what weighs us down - the very idea of causing disappointment in our creator is more dampening to our spirits than any amount of ^{rain.} ~~water.~~ Still, as the old man says: "what's the use of complaining". So I ~~had~~ continue, plodding relentlessly on, setting in to my task with resignation. I was

(Page 3 of 6)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

Written Work

a fool to be eager for the work, they ^{prepared} got me
~~ready~~ ^{for it -} ~~to~~ rubbing me down and feeding me oats. I
was as eager as the young lad, tired of inaction
and wanting to move. My enthusiasm has faded
though, even as the young man's will in time. ~~After~~ IP
Eventually the coal dust will stop clouding the truth
and he will realize the backbreaking reality of the
coal itself. He will ^{slowly} begin to and wear down
bend ^{legs.} and it will become more and
more difficult for him to stand on his own ~~to~~
like the old man he will be beaten down and broken
^{able}
until he no longer is ~~able~~ to leave. Or, like his
father he will escape the constraints of this place

(Page 4 of 6)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

Written Work

and seek ~~for~~ his fortunes elsewhere, ~~most likely~~
Me will be the
leaving a family here to starve. ~~that is the~~
catches
horse who walks for himself and ~~causes~~ others in
the wheel of his turning - cutting off a limb
even while they look on. In either case,
he will only come to realize how foolish he
has been ~~to~~ to harness himself to his
but he will already be
circumstances ~~when he is already~~ bound to it.
certainly
He is a plow horse, as ~~some~~ as I am,
there is no doubt in that and there is no
escaping it with your life in one ^{piece} ~~piece~~. He had
better get used to rain and tears because there is

(Page 5 of 6)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

Written Work

no use in complaining about it. That is
and
why I work now, that is why I will
continue to work, lugging the coal until
my ~~back~~ back breaks and my legs give
out from underneath me.

(Page 6 of 6)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–2

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (E)</p> <p>The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>The student’s choice to explore the text through the persona of the horse provides an effective vehicle for an insightful exploration of the idea that “Initially an individual does not view his circumstance as a constraint but comes to realize it with experience.” The narrative position of the horse affords a confident comparison of Mr. Hannon and Frankie evident in discerning perceptions such as “Like the old man he will be beaten down and broken until he no longer is able to leave” and “he will only come to realize how foolish he has been to harness himself to his circumstances but he will already be bound to it.”</p> <p>“The tears of God perhaps, weeping for the foolishness and hardship of his creation” and “He will be the horse who walks for himself and catches others in the wheel of his turning – cutting off limb even while they look on” are examples of precise support that aptly reinforces the student’s metaphoric approach in adopting the perspective of the horse.</p>

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 3 Scored Excellent (E)

Initial Planning

Your initial planning will assist markers in identifying the text or texts to which you are responding.

For each text you will reference, briefly identify the central idea that is most relevant to what you intend to explore.

The central idea that I find most relevant is the ~~the~~ impact constraints have ~~on someone~~ ~~due~~ to convention or circumstances, ~~and how they~~ ~~do~~ have on someone and the resulting emotions or ~~actions~~ actions.

Briefly identify what idea you intend to explore.

In Wilmer Mills' poem "Diary of a Piano-Tuner's Wife", the pain or suffering the wife feels and how she deals with the constraints her husband places on her.

State your choice of prose form. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do not use a poetic form.

a commentary

(Page 1 of 6)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 3 Scored Excellent (E)

*If you are using a word processor, staple your Personal Response here.
You may make corrections directly on your printed page(s).*

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Burning
Written Work

Being subjected to constraints of any kind is a burden ^{everyone} ~~we~~ must bear at ^{any given} ~~any~~ moment in ^{their} ~~the~~ life. However, what defines us is our ability and how we overcome the constraints of conventions or circumstances. In the poem "Diary of a Piano-Tuner's Wife," by Wilmer Mills, the path a wife chooses to take in order to release herself from her constraints is documented in her diary. Mills uses her choices and actions to suggest ^{that} ~~the idea~~ we must take action to overthrow constraints; if not, we may grow discontent ^{in ourselves} ~~and~~ ~~and~~ ~~because~~ of the inability to grow in any manner, spiritually, emotionally, or otherwise.

Mills first ^{solidifies the} ~~sets a~~ ~~clear~~ identity of the ^{author} ~~wife~~ of the diary in the first stanza. She is a wife, a mother and she is unhappy with how her life has turned out. The multiple end stopped lines in a ^{six} ~~four~~ line stanza ^{suggests} ~~supports the~~ ~~idea~~ of

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 3 Scored Excellent (E)

Written Work

her lack of enthusiasm with herself, ^{The caesura involving} ~~the~~ "she never calls," isolates ~~her~~ ^{her} ~~family~~ and reveals her desire ~~to~~ for human contact. She misses her daughter, she can't even "recognize her voice or how she looks or anything," ^{with her husband's constraints on her} ~~the~~ ^{are killing her in many ways starting with her emotion} ~~choice of action~~. The wife's ~~choice of action~~ ^{choice of action} to counteract her unhappiness, is to "let his garden die." She wants to let her husband's precious garden, the one she has "been compelled to garden ever since" his accident, to die. ~~the~~ ^{her} ~~her~~ first battle is with the "bed-row stones" she dug them ~~her~~ away. The connotation of "bed-row" ~~is~~ ^{is} of ~~stability and steadiness~~ ^{stability and steadiness}, bed-rock for a foundation, Mills could be suggesting that the wife's first move is to remove, or destabilize their foundation ~~of~~ ^{of} marriage. ^{alludes} The pile of stones "had the look of Bible altars," ~~the~~ ^{the} wife ~~is~~ ^{is} the remains of the stones to a symbol often linked to spiritual release, sacrifice and cleansing. ~~the~~ ^{The} ~~allusion~~ ^{allusion} is further specified to when "Moses led the Hebrews out of Egypt," "Moses led the Hebrews" out of the oppressive constraints of the ~~the~~ ^{the} Egyptians, much like how her removal of the stones is her first steps

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 3 Scored Excellent (E)

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Written Work ^{she chooses to mention how the}
away from her husband, ^{the} "waters of" ^{her} "world"
were parted" ^{after} the removal of the
"bed-rock stones". This reveals her ^{new found} insight, ^{to} her ascension
from the constraints of ignorance. ^{She} The "waters"
that once blinded her, ^{restricted} her from
truly living ^{and} bonding with her daughter ^{has now}
been "parted", as "Moses" parted the Red Sea in
their escape from ^{an} suppression.

She discovers who she truly is beneath all
of the "rocks" that kept her under constraints.
She ^{realizes} ^{that} how she in many ways is
like the "mold and lichen" ^{that} ^{grows} under the
"rocks". She is delicate and underappreciated, ^{often times}
overlooked. She grows in ^{"lacy patterns"}, ^{that suggests she is} feminine,
fragile and beautiful. However, she is also stubborn,
tenacious, and will strive to live in any circumstances,
to thrive in any circumstances, under any
constraints.

Because of her escape from ^{her} constraints,
her insight into herself, she can now "understand"
her husband. She understands why he feels

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 3 Scored Excellent (E)

Written Work

the need to always reach for what he cannot attain, she understands that her husband cannot overcome the constraint of losing his arm. She realizes that he lives in the past, on that "cubit-length of battlefield in France". Because of this, she has been forced to tend to his "garden", to his wounds, physical and emotional and she has ~~been reduced to a~~ ^{been reduced to a} subdued ^{and} subjugated life. She ~~sees what he~~ likens the "mulish" tendencies ~~to~~ ^{to} "mulish" sentiments that "governs" his "heart" ~~to~~ ^{to} a "mulish type" ~~to~~ ^{to} "mulish" connotes a sense of ~~animistic~~ ^{animistic}, ~~at~~ ^{below} her and incredibly stubborn, which contrasts with the idea that he ~~is~~ ^{keeps} the word in tune". ~~She~~ ^{her} tone when describing her husband shifts constantly between a muted ~~entry~~ ^{entry} and under ~~the~~ ^{since} she has ~~overcome~~ ^{found} her "phantom limb" ~~his~~ ^{his} weakness, she views him as an animal that is unable to rise above himself. ~~She~~ ^{she} ~~maintains~~ ^{maintains} The various caesuras used to separate "Now I know, and so will he." creates a ^{definitive} tone. She is confident now, she has moved beyond ignorance and she intends to let him know, she is "more". The enjambment used to isolate ~~the~~ ^{the} idea of ~~his~~ ^{his} "I'm more/ than just another string he fails to notice" ~~is~~ ^{is} ~~repeated~~ ^{repeated} ~~and~~ ^{and} someone, to gain ~~the~~ ^{the} what has been denied her for so long.

William suggests "August, 1950" is ~~the~~ ^{the} most important month of her life. She escaped the constraints of convention and ~~circumstances~~ ^{circumstances} she follows the "burning" of her heart, and was ~~led~~ ^{led} out of captivity.

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example 3 Scored Excellent (E)

* Conclusion

Wilmer Mills uses the Piano-tuner's wife to reveal our own dilemmas we face. He wants us to realize our role in our own fate. She did not have "Moses" on a "burning" ~~be~~ bush" to guide her out. She had herself, her own heart, her own sufferings to lead her out. In order ~~to~~ ~~to~~ ^{to truly live,} an understanding of ourselves must be gained; ^{however,} in order to know ourself, we must rise above any constraints we suffer under.

(Page 6 of 6)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT—3

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (E)</p> <p>The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p><i>Although the sophistication and depth of this student’s analysis would arguably place this example paper at the high end of the Excellent category, it provides a model for those students who might wish to respond by writing a traditional commentary, a form often taught in classrooms but rarely produced by students for the Personal Response.</i></p> <p>The student’s exploration of the topic through a commentary of what the poem suggests about the wife’s response to “the constraints of conventions or circumstances” is insightful. For example, the student argues that the “connotation of ‘bed-row’” signifies “stability and steadiness, bed-rock for a foundation” and that the “wife’s first move is to remove, or destabilize their foundation of marriage.” Further insightful exploration is shown in the analysis of the “allusion” to Moses, and how “‘waters’ that once blinded her, restricted her from truly living and bonding with her daughter has now been ‘parted’, as ‘Moses’ parted the Red Sea in their escape from suppression.”</p> <p>The commentary includes a series of perceptions chosen to establish the wife’s identity. For example, the point that the “caesura involving ‘[s]he never calls’ isolates her pain and reveals her desire for human contact” is one of many perceptions that are both confident and discerning. Similar is the observation that “[M]ulish connotes a sense of animalistic, below her and incredibly stubborn, which contrasts with the idea that he ‘keep[s] the world in tune.’”</p> <p>The student’s ideas and impressions that the wife’s “choices and actions” to “overthrow constraints” are used to “suggest that we must take action” and “if not, we may grow discontent in ourselves because of the inability to grow in any manner, spiritually, emotionally or otherwise” are aptly reinforced by numerous precise supporting details, such as when “She realizes how she in many ways is like the ‘mold and lichen’ found under the ‘rocks’”. She is delicate and underappreciated, oftentimes overlooked.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT—3

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Presentation (E)</p> <p>The voice created by the student is convincing.</p> <p>Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept.</p> <p>The unifying effect is skillfully developed.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>A convincing voice is created throughout in lines such as “She wants to let her husband’s precious garden, the one she has ‘been compelled to garden ever since’ his accident, to die” and “She is confident now, she has moved beyond ignorance and she intends to let him know, she is ‘more.’”</p> <p>Stylistic choices, as evidenced in complex lines such as “Because of this, she has been forced to tend to his ‘garden’, to his wounds, physical and emotional and she has been reduced to a subdued and subjugated life,” are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept.</p> <p>The unifying effect, crafted through a comprehensive analysis of how the poem addresses the topic and through a consistently adept tone, is skillfully developed as the student moves through the poem logically, starting with a description of the wife’s identity and building an argument which reaches a rather triumphant crescendo with the final line “The enjambment used to isolate ‘I’m more / [t]han just another string he fails to notice,’ reveals her determination to be someone, to gain what has been denied her for so long.” Throughout the commentary, the student is careful to inject echoes of the topic in sentences such as “However, she is also stubborn, tenacious, and will strive to live in any circumstances, to thrive in any circumstances, under any constraints,” again contributing to the development of the unifying effect.</p>

English Language Arts 30-1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

Hamlet - Shakespeare
Streetcar named Desire - Tennessee Williams

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

I chose both a Streetcar named
Desire by Tennessee Williams and
Hamlet by William Shakespeare. I believe
these two texts work very well for
this topic, especially a streetcar named
Desire, as the main character Blanche
Dubois attempts to live life unconstrained.
Hamlet also works well as initially he did not
seem to deem life significant.

Additional space is provided for *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text*

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Throughout an individual's life, many unforeseen circumstances arise. Some may be positive, while some may be negative. Some may have been earned, or been there for a lack of effort. Although many circumstances may be unforeseen, some are expected, especially if an individual does something negative. Throughout many texts, text creator's attempt to show protagonists that are able to live unconstrained by anything, including conventions, or circumstances. In Tennessee Williams *A Streetcar Named Desire*, the protagonist Blanche Dubois attempts to live life unconstrained by previous circumstances throughout her life. In William Shakespeare's *Hamlet*, Hamlet is clearly unable to live life unconstrained by the circumstances, and demands, put on to him. In both of these texts, the text creator clearly outlines how circumstances may effect an individual, whether it be obviously, or hidden.

In *A Streetcar Named Desire*, Blanche Dubois attempts to move on with life, and temporarily move in with her sister, Stella Kowalski. Blanche Dubois had a very troubling past, and she is attempting to escape it at all costs. With Blanche's move, Stanley is seen as an obstacle, being able to see right through Blanche's eye's straight from her arrival. The key word used when mentioning Blanche is attempt. If it were not for Stanley, this attempt may have been successful. With Stanley in the picture, Blanche is unable to live life unconstrained by convention, or circumstances. In regards to Blanche's past, at

(Page 2 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

first she married at a very young age, and truly loved her husband. Unfortunately, Blanche discovered her young husband Allan, was engaging in homosexual activities, cheating on her, and this caused many problems. At first she shrugged it off, as they went to a casino to have a night full of fun and adventure, but Blanche freaked out at Allan, and he ended up committing suicide. From then on, Blanche's life was different. Her relationships were short, and she was seen as a sexual maniac. In Laurel, where Blanche taught English, she had a very poor reputation, for Blanche had been in a relationship with a student. She lost her job due to that and then moved in with Stella. When Blanche meets Mitch, at Stanley's poker game, the future looks promising for her. Tennessee Williams is showing at this moment, that perhaps a person can successfully attempt to live unconstrained by previous circumstances throughout their life. Also, Williams succeeds in developing more ideas throughout the text. When Blanche's past catches up with her, mostly due to Stanley, Blanche's life heads into even more turmoil. She is taken into a mental hospital, where perhaps she will be helped, which is unknown to the reader at this point. Tennessee Williams clearly outlines the fact that Blanche Dubois attempts to live life unconstrained by these past circumstances in her life, but this text creator also clearly shows that she fails at it. Although Blanche failed, she did attempt. And that is the key to judging a character such as Blanche Dubois. One cannot write her off as a maniac, sexual predator. One must judge her by her true intentions, as "A lady's charm is half illusion". (Blanche Dubois). Throughout *A Streetcar Named Desire*, Blanche

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Dubois attempts to escape her very troubling past, but unfortunately at the end, she fails.

In William Shakespeare's *Hamlet*, the main character Hamlet receives an unforeseen circumstance, and demand, put forth on him. Hamlet was a renaissance prince, one of high respect throughout Denmark. However, when Hamlet receives the news that his father was murdered by Claudius, from his father's ghost, his life changes. William Shakespeare clearly shows a change in Hamlet's perspective, and shows that Hamlet will be unable to live life unconstrained by these new circumstances. Hamlet, tells his most trustworthy friend Horatio, and begins to undergo a change, one of feigning madness. This is just the beginning of Shakespeare showing that Hamlet is unable to even attempt to live life unconstrained, following the news. His life completely changed, as Hamlet at first attempts to discover if the traitorous news he received was true. One cannot fault Hamlet, for seeking to avenge his father's death. However, with Hamlet's antic disposition, the significance of living life as he normally would have has diminished. He no longer cares about anything, except avenging his father's death. Hamlet does not worry about his own life, only the end of Claudius's life. In Act 5 of *Hamlet*, it seems after returning from England, that with Hamlet's new perspective on life, he attempts to live life unconstrained by this duty put forth on him, and just wait for the proper time to come. This shows a change in the character Hamlet by Shakespeare. It is also at this time that Hamlet believes he has providence, and fate, on his side. Everything he believes

(Page 4 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

seems to be going his way. When Shakespeare shows this change in Hamlet, it seems to show a higher significance toward living life as you should have, and this is shown when Hamlet proclaims "It is I, Hamlet the Dane". After Hamlet duels Laertes, and everyone ends up with a negative destiny of death, Hamlet's last goal in life is for Horatio to tell the story of the real Hamlet, not altered by false rumors, and what not. When Horatio wants to kill himself alongside Hamlet's death, Hamlet does not allow him to, as he wants Horatio to live unconstrained by these deaths. He also wants Horatio to leave a positive legacy about Hamlet, one of a hero, not a traitor. It is through the character Hamlet that Shakespeare shows late in the play that there is indeed a large significance when it comes to an individual attempting to live life unconstrained, for it is even when Hamlet is attempting this, that he committed his father's request.

The significance of living life unconstrained by conventions or circumstances is a very large one. Some believe that an individual cannot live their life if they are constantly worrying about every minor circumstance. Many text creators' show the protagonist attempting to live life unconstrained, but failing. The best example for this is *A Streetcar Named Desire* by Tennessee Williams. The significance shown is large, as Blanche attempted to move on with her life, but ultimately, as mentioned, failed. Other text creator's such as Shakespeare, change between the ideas of little, to large significance, in living life unconstrained. It is at the end that ultimately Shakespeare shows that living life unconstrained is important, as eventually events will inevitably catch up to

(Page 5 of 6)

**English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007**

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

you, as Claudius attempted to get Hamlet killed. It is important to an individual to not be completely effected by something that occurs in reality, especially if they may be the cause of it. An individual succeeding at living life unconstrained by previous circumstances will inevitably change their life. They will move on, and have a second chance at living life in a positive way. It is through these texts and many more that text creators show the significance (or lack of) of living life unconstrained by convention or circumstance.

(Page 6 of 6)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Thought and Understanding (S)</p> <p>Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic.</p> <p>Literary interpretations are general but plausible.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>The ideas such as “With Stanley in the picture, Blanche is unable to live life unconstrained by convention, or circumstances” and “Hamlet will be unable to live life unconstrained by these new circumstances” are relevant and straightforward.</p> <p>The arguments that “Blanche Dubois had a very troubling past, and she is attempting to escape it at all costs” and “Hamlet does not worry about his own life, only the end of Claudius’s life” demonstrate a generalized comprehension of the literary texts and the topic.</p> <p>The observations that “Tennessee Williams is showing at this moment, that perhaps a person can successfully attempt to live unconstrained by previous circumstances throughout their life” and “It is at the end that ultimately Shakespeare shows that living life unconstrained is important, as eventually events will inevitably catch up to you, as Claudius attempted to get Hamlet killed” provide examples of literary interpretations that are general but plausible.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Supporting Evidence (S)</p> <p>Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness.</p> <p>A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>The student’s idea regarding Blanche’s attempt to live unconstrained by her past is reinforced in an acceptable way through adequate if general supporting details such as “When Blanche meets Mitch, at Stanley’s poker game, the future looks promising for her,” “When Blanche’s past catches up with her, mostly due to Stanley, Blanche’s life heads into even more turmoil. She is taken into a mental hospital,” and “One must judge her by her true intentions, as ‘A lady’s charm is half illusion.’” The support for the student’s idea regarding the constraint experienced by Hamlet is appropriately chosen as in “However, when Hamlet receives the news that his father was murdered by Claudius, from his father’s ghost, his life changes.”</p> <p>Occasionally, support may lack persuasiveness, as identified in the discussion of Hamlet: “with Hamlet’s antic disposition, the significance of living life as he normally would have has diminished” and “In Act 5 of <i>Hamlet</i>, it seems after returning from England, that with Hamlet’s new perspective on life, he attempts to live life unconstrained by this duty put forth on him, and just wait for the proper time to come.”</p> <p>A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained through reiterations of key words from the thesis in lines such as “there is indeed a large significance when it comes to an individual attempting to live life unconstrained.”</p>

English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Form and Structure (S)</p> <p>A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately.</p> <p>The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p>	<p>Following the introduction, which focuses our attention on how neither Blanche Dubois nor Hamlet are able “to live life unconstrained by previous circumstances,” a straightforward arrangement of ideas and details, drawn first from a discussion of <i>A Streetcar Named Desire</i> and followed by a discussion of <i>Hamlet</i>, provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately.</p> <p>The controlling idea that “In both of these texts, the text creator clearly outlines how circumstances may effect an individual, whether it be obviously, or hidden” is generally presented and maintained in an analysis of both <i>A Streetcar Named Desire</i> and <i>Hamlet</i>. However, with statements like “It is also at this time that Hamlet believes he has providence, and fate, on his side. Everything he believes seems to be going his way,” coherence may falter. The student’s unifying effect is rooted in a discussion of the two texts, but the logic tying the two works together in a meaningful way is at times tenuous.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Choice (S)</p> <p>Diction is adequate.</p> <p>Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward.</p> <p>Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>Diction choices such as “freaked” and “sexual maniac,” or the sentence “With Blanche’s move, Stanley is seen as an obstacle, being able to see right through Blanche’s eye’s straight from her arrival” are adequate.</p> <p>Though syntactic structures are generally straightforward, attempts at complex structures as evidenced in sentences such as “She is taken into a mental hospital, where perhaps she will be helped, which is unknown to the reader at this point” and “In William Shakespeare’s <i>Hamlet</i>, the main character Hamlet receives an unforeseen circumstance, and demand, put forth on him” are awkward.</p> <p>Phrases like “One cannot write her off as a maniac, sexual predator. One must judge her by her true intentions, as ‘A lady’s charm is half illusion’” and “He also wants Horatio to leave a positive legacy about Hamlet, one of a hero, not a traitor” provide examples of stylistic choices that contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Correctness (S)</p> <p>This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</p> <p>There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p>	<p>In such examples as “Although many circumstances may be unforeseen, some are expected, especially if an individual does something negative,” it is evident that the writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</p> <p>However, there are occasional lapses in control and minor errors, particularly in the case of comma usage: “In Act 5 of <i>Hamlet</i>, it seems after returning from England, that with Hamlet’s new perspective on life, he attempts to live life unconstrained by this duty put forth on him, and just wait for the proper time to come.”</p>

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

Film - Shawshank Redemption
Frank Darabont

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

Andy isn't constrained by his circumstance but he
learns to deal with it and not become overwhelmed.
He keeps up his hope and doesn't allow others^{to}
to bury it
Andy still lives a full life despite the fact he's in
prison - carves chess pieces - helps Tommy
- creates library - tax problem
He makes his poor circumstances into an object of
opportunity.

Additional space is provided for *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text*

(Page 1 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

Curve Balls

Life throws you curve balls. It isn't in the way that they are thrown that allows you to hit them, but rather the way you swing the bat. Responding to different circumstances can be done in many different ways. Some people respond in ways which cause them to strike out. Others however are able to look at life through a strange, new perspective and hit home runs. Andy Dufresne in the film Shawshank Redemption created by Frank Darabont was able to not only be unconstrained by his adverse situation, but he was able to create it into rare opportunity which offered the prisoners new hope. He hit a home run that brought many players to home base.

Andy didn't let others define who he was, but rather he lived his life in a way that he could be happy with. Giving up on what meant most to him was not an option. When Andy believed that he could change the outcome of an event he wouldn't just sit on the sidelines and wait for someone else to do it, rather he would do it himself. The ball truly ~~went into play once Andy offered Hadley, the guard, his services to help him with a tax~~ problem he was having. After almost being nearly pushed off the roof, Andy became recognized as a man with whom to be reckoned. This incident didn't just give the men a few beers to drink, but rather it gave Andy an escape from the brutalizing work he previously had to do. This is the turning point in his life in which Andy's fate in prison begins to start looking up. He didn't realize his one daring action would change the entire outcome of his life in prison, but he didn't allow his circumstances to hinder his attempt to live a life that would be rewarding and pleasing in his own eyes.

In the twenty years that Andy was in prison, he was able to build the most amazing library ever seen in a prison before. His position helping the guards and Norton

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

the warden with their taxes and financial situations gave him opportunities that the other _____ prisoners didn't have. He was awarded permission to write letters to get funding for new books and to develop a much more substantial library that would enrich the lives of the prisoners. When he was finally given funding, and a few donations, he didn't determine to continue writing one letter a week, but rather to write two. He used his position to create a life that was much more enriched for the prisoners and didn't let the resistance hinder him, but rather to encourage him to continue trying and to never give up. While in prison Andy realized how hopeless and lost many of them were and that they needed to find a way in which they felt free again. Building the library gave the prisoners a new hope of a life that long ago died.

Throughout his life in prison, Andy never lets go of his hope. His way ^{was} to fill ~~the~~ his time ~~was~~ to ensure that he didn't give up on what meant most to him on the outside. This included carving stone, doing the taxes, and working on the library. Andy wanted to hold ~~onto his hope and find a way not to become institutionalized.~~ He wished to remain a man whom, despite life's curve balls, is able keep a level head and not get overwhelmed by his adverse situations. While discussing Brooks and his death Red mentions a very interesting statement about the walls. "First you hate them, then you get used to them. There comes a time that you depend on them." Red realizes that the prison warps you into an individual who is reliant upon others for everything, you become institutionalized. This is also supported by his statement "They put you in here for life and that's exactly what they take." Andy sees how the other prisoners like Red have lost most of their hope. He understands that though his circumstances are most trying and almost unbearable he has to find a way to hold onto his hope, and he does that by holding on to

(Page 3 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007**

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

what meant the most to him on the outside and not letting the prison take away his...
individuality.

Living in the prison allowed Andy to help those who needed help the most. He didn't get discouraged when he was surrounded by uneducated people, but rather he took the chance to educate them and give them a new hope for their own future. To help overcome his circumstances, he helped others overcome their own. When Tommy came to prison, Andy state that "maybe you should change your profession," this was a way in which Andy encouraged Tommy to leave his past life and enter into a much more rewarding life without the crime. When he helped Tommy to study to get his high school diploma, Andy doesn't give up on him, but coaches him through everything filling up a year of his time encouraging a pupil who is full of pep and vinegar. Being around Tommy who was so young and still had so much of life to live gave Andy inspiration and gave him new hope of life outside of prison. He helped so many people while in prison and didn't allow ~~the~~ his adverse circumstances to become unbearable by dwelling on all the bad things in his life, but rather the accomplishments he saw in others.

Andy coped with prison life in such a way that the entire Shawshank prison was... changed from the inside out. Despite his innocence, Andy was able to overcome the circumstances of his life which illustrates how no matter what life throws at you, if you just swing a few times, you're bound to hit a few too. Don't let life's curve balls knock you down. Get up and try again, because it just might be worth it. Be like Andy and swing.

(Page 4 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Thought and Understanding (Pf)</p> <p>Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Pf</p>	<p>The student’s discussion of how “Some people respond in ways which cause them to strike out. Others however are able to look at life through a strange, new perspective and hit home runs” is thoughtful. From this statement, the student moves to the considered controlling idea that Andy Dufresne “was able to not only be unconstrained by his adverse situation, but he was able to create it into rare opportunity which offered the prisoners new hope.”</p> <p>A competent comprehension of the relationship between the literary text and topic is demonstrated in the development of the student’s idea that “Andy didn’t let others define who he was, but rather he lived his life in a way that he could be happy with.” The student offers the sensible interpretations that Andy could “develop a much more substantial library that would enrich the lives of the prisoners,” encourage “Tommy to leave his past life and enter into a much more rewarding life without the crime,” and ultimately not “allow his adverse circumstances to become unbearable by dwelling on all the bad things in his life.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Supporting Evidence (Pf)</p> <p>Support is specific, and well chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a persuasive way. A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Pf</p>	<p>Support is well chosen to reinforce the student’s persuasive idea that Andy “understands that though his circumstances are most trying and almost unbearable he has to find a way to hold onto his hope.” The student chooses specific details demonstrating Andy’s ability to maintain this hope by “carving stone, doing the taxes, and working on the library,” and by determining not “to continue writing one letter a week, but rather to write two.”</p> <p>A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained through the descriptions of the impact Andy has on the other prisoners: “Andy became recognized as a man with whom to be reckoned,” who “took the chance to educate them,” and “gave the prisoners a new hope of a life that long ago died.” The sound connection is further reinforced in the concluding paragraph with “Andy coped with prison life in such a way that the entire Shawshank prison was changed from the inside out.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Form and Structure (Pf)</p> <p>A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably.</p> <p>The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;">Pf</p>	<p>The purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion of the main idea, that literally Andy “was able to not only be unconstrained by his adverse situation, but he was able to create it into rare opportunity which offered the prisoners new hope” and figuratively that “Some people respond in ways which cause them to strike out. Others however are able to look at life through a strange, new perspective and hit home runs.” The student develops the discussion capably through the use of a baseball metaphor which begins with “Life throws you curve balls.” The unifying effect is coherently sustained and presented through the purposeful arrangement of “He hit a home run that brought many players to home base,” “he wouldn’t just sit on the sidelines and wait for someone else,” and “despite life’s curve balls, [he] is able to keep a level head and not get overwhelmed.” The student concludes the controlled discussion with “no matter what life throws at you, if you just swing a few times, you’re bound to hit a few too,” and “Be like Andy and swing.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Choice (Pf)</p> <p>Diction is specific. Syntactic structures are generally effective. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;">Pf</p>	<p>Diction is specific as in “He was awarded permission to write letters to get funding for new books and to develop a much more substantial library that would enrich the lives of the prisoners” and in “he didn’t determine to continue writing one letter a week, but rather to write two.” Syntactic structures are generally effective as in “Living in the prison allowed Andy to help those who needed help the most” and in “When he helped Tommy to study to get his high school diploma, Andy doesn’t give up on him, but coaches him through everything filling up a year of his time encouraging a pupil who is full of pep and vinegar.” Stylistic choices, such as “Others however are able to look at life through a strange, new perspective and hit home runs” and “He didn’t realize his one daring action would change the entire outcome of his life in prison, but he didn’t allow his circumstances to hinder his attempt to live a life that would be rewarding and pleasing in his own eyes.” contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Correctness (Pf)</p> <p>This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;">Pf</p>	<p>Competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics is evident in “The ball truly went into play once Andy offered Hadley, the guard, his services to help him with a tax problem he was having,” “He didn’t get discouraged when he was surrounded by uneducated people, but rather he took the chance to educate them and give them a new hope for their own future,” and “He helped so many people while in prison and didn’t allow his adverse circumstances to become unbearable by dwelling on all the bad things in his life, but rather the accomplishment he saw in others.” Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</p>

English Language Arts 30-1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

"The Lottery" - Shirley Jackson

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

"The Lottery" → peer pressure

→ tradition

→ hostility towards detractors

Mrs. Hutchinson → victim

Mr. Summers → enabler

Old Man Warner → tradition

English Language Arts 30-1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text

Blindly following tradition → no one thinks twice about (part of life)

→ acceptance of the rules

→ Old Man Warner

Hostility towards those who depart from tradition

→ other town abandoning "No good will come of this"

→ Lottery = harvest, good luck

4

(Page 2 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Excellent (E)

As long as there have been societies, there have been traditions and conventions one is expected to follow. This helps connect one with the past and, therefore, their heritage. However, this practice, like anything else in life, is dangerous when taken to extremes. Shirley Jackson's short story, *The Lottery*, illustrates the danger inherent in traditions and fanaticism. The author paints a vivid portrait of a small town where, not only are the conventions of the day followed blindly, there is a hostility felt towards those who would deter from their beliefs and modernize, no matter how rational their reasoning. The efforts of the townspeople and the subsequent events exemplify the dangers posed by convention that all societies face.

The concept that all customs should be respected by the youth and upheld by the wise is not a novel one and is greatly expanded on within *The Lottery*. The first instance of such occurs when the citizens of the small, rural town begin to congregate for an event the reader knows only as "the lottery". There is, at first, nothing sinister suggested by the gathering at all. This is true to the sentiment felt by the townspeople that the lottery is routine, expected and even mundane. Characters are heard hoping that the lottery is not expected to be more than two hours long and the wives anticipate being home in time for supper. The idea of this rite being a humdrum activity to the villagers is sharply contrasted by the true nature of the event, yet is realistic in the sense that, having been exposed to this ceremony their entire lives, no one is expected to question it at all. Later on, Bill Hutchinson's family is selected by the draw. Despite the fact that all the family members are well-

(Page 3 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Excellent (E)

aware of the consequences of being selected, only Mrs. Hutchinson shows any signs of distress, and she is quickly silenced. Bill Hutchinson's blind acceptance of his or his family's fate demonstrates how deeply ingrained the idea of the lottery is in his mind, surpassing even the human desire of self-preservation. Once the final draw is concluded and the town learns that Tessie Hutchinson, a mother, wife, member of the community and a seemingly decent human being, has been selected, there is no hesitation on the part of the villagers or even from her own family. She is quickly stoned to death by her friends, children and husband. This brutal, merciless act is the final instance in which the reader is exposed to the monstrous crimes that can be committed in the name of the status quo. In any other, non-lottery practicing, town, would a small child throw rocks at his own mother simply because the masses tell him "This is what must be done."? It is therefore reasonable to conclude that acts such as the lottery must be ingrained in the minds of all those involved in order to take place. By the simple fact that it acts as both the enabler and as the crime itself, convention is demonstrated as being dangerous due to those who will follow it unquestionably.

When a certain convention is in place, opposing it can be dangerous and detrimental. By clinging to a certain ideal and showing hostility towards those who would detract from it, society limits free-thinking and, potentially, improvements in the way the culture acts. The townspeople in *The Lottery* frequently scorn those who are in opposition to the ritual. When Tessie Hutchinson is selected, she protests the fairness of the lottery and questions its use. While her objections may have been

(Page 4 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Excellent (E)

simple acts of self-preservation, her claims still ring true. They were, however, quickly stifled by those around her. The villagers would not accept any criticism of their way of life and the way of life of their ancestors. Perhaps this is because the villagers were well aware that, when asked why they continued practicing this act of brutality, the best answer they would be able to provide would be “Because it has always been this way.” Justification for ostracism of those who oppose the town’s practice is offered by Old Man Warner. Mr. Warner makes the claim that, without a lottery, the harvest that autumn would be poor and the village would suffer. This elevates the lottery from brutal tradition to ritual sacrifice. The bad luck that the villagers feel the lack of a lottery would entail explains the ill-will felt towards those who disagree with the custom. Convention within the town dictates that the lottery must occur or they would face disastrous consequences. However, the apparent duty that the villagers are doing towards their town, while it would explain the scorn felt towards Mrs. Hutchinson, does nothing to explain the intense dislike Mr. Warner exclaims over neighbouring towns that have abolished the lottery. Naming them idiots and young fools, Mr. Warner’s obsession with this tradition goes far beyond a need for a good harvest. His sense of right and wrong has been so skewed by his town’s convention that he is unable to tolerate those who would challenge it. The irrational resentment felt by the townspeople towards those who would challenge the status quo is yet another danger inherent in convention and tradition.

Through realistic characterization and story-telling, Shirley Jackson allows the reader to view modern society in a microcosm. Conventions that are taken for

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2007

Example Scored Excellent (E)

granted are challenged and the reader is made reflect on the current balance between respecting history and being able to recognize a poor choice. Throughout *The Lottery*, conventional wisdom and tradition is analyzed and the destructive tendencies that it entails are criticized. A theme that is elaborated on within the text is whether or not one may flourish in a town dominated by convention. Ultimately, the reader sees that, short of a massive social upheaval, happiness is very hard to find when one must act within the constraints of society. Shirley Jackson's *The Lottery* addressed the issues that tradition raises and challenges the way in which the status quo is respected. The relevance of this message to the real world is evident and the reader is asked to reconsider the state of the society in which they are a part.

(Page 6 of 6)

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Thought and Understanding (E)</p> <p>Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic.</p> <p>Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>Ideas such as “there have been traditions and conventions one is expected to follow” in conjunction with “However, this practice, like anything else in life, is dangerous when taken to extremes” are insightful and carefully considered. The student’s continued recognition of “not only are the conventions of the day followed blindly, there is a hostility felt towards those who would deter from their beliefs and modernize, no matter how rational their reasoning. The efforts of the townspeople and the subsequent events exemplify the dangers posed by convention that all societies face” demonstrates a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text and topic.</p> <p>Literary interpretations that “Bill Hutchinson’s blind acceptance of his or his family’s fate demonstrates how deeply ingrained the idea of the lottery is in his mind, surpassing even the human desire of self-preservation,” “This elevates the lottery from brutal tradition to ritual sacrifice,” and “The irrational resentment felt by the townspeople towards those who would challenge the status quo is yet another danger inherent in convention and tradition” are perceptive and illuminating.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Supporting Evidence (E)</p> <p>Support is precise and astutely chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a convincing way. A valid connection to the student’s ideas is efficiently maintained.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>To emphasize how ingrained the lottery ritual is in the minds of the villagers, the student offers such effective precise support as “She is quickly stoned to death by her friends, children and husband” and “without a lottery, the harvest that autumn would be poor and the village would suffer.” Astutely chosen support is also evident in the student’s examination of Tessie’s very human recognition of the truth: “While her objections may have been simple acts of self-preservation, her claims still ring true. They were, however, quickly stifled by those around her.”</p> <p>A progression of support ranging from “Characters are heard hoping that the lottery is not expected to be more than two hours long and the wives anticipate being home in time for supper” to “Perhaps this is because the villagers were well aware that, when asked why they continued practicing this act of brutality, the best answer they would be able to provide would be ‘Because it has always been this way’” and eventually to “Naming them [neighbouring villagers] idiots and young fools, Mr. Warner’s obsession with this tradition goes far beyond a need for a good harvest” provides a valid connection to and efficiently maintains the idea that Mr. Warner’s “sense of right and wrong has been so skewed by his town’s convention that he is unable to tolerate those who would challenge it.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Form and Structure (E)</p> <p>A judicious arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully.</p> <p>The unifying effect or controlling idea is effectively sustained and integrated.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>The student demonstrates a judicious arrangement of ideas and details related to the ritual of the lottery in “The first instance of such occurs when the citizens of the small, rural town begin to congregate for an event the reader knows only as ‘the lottery,’” “Later on, Bill Hutchinson’s family is selected by the draw,” “Once the final draw is concluded the town learns that Tessie Hutchinson, the mother, wife, member of the community and a seemingly decent human being, has been selected, there is no hesitation on the part of the villagers or even from her own family,” and “Ultimately, the reader sees that, short of a massive social upheaval, happiness is very hard to find when one must act within the constraints of society.”</p> <p>The controlling idea that “As long as there have been societies, there have been traditions and conventions that one is expected to follow” is effectively sustained and integrated in the paper and it culminates in “Throughout <i>The Lottery</i>, conventional wisdom and tradition is analyzed and the destructive tendencies that it entails are criticized.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Choice (E)</p> <p>Diction is precise. Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>Precise diction is demonstrated in “Shirley Jackson’s short story, <i>The Lottery</i>, illustrates the danger inherent in traditions and fanaticism” and in “This brutal, merciless act is the final instance in which the reader is exposed to the monstrous crimes that can be committed in the name of the status quo.”</p> <p>Syntactic structures such as “The idea of this rite being a humdrum activity to the villagers is sharply contrasted by the true nature of the event, yet is realistic in the sense that, having been exposed to this ceremony their entire lives, no one is expected to question it at all” and “In any other, non-lottery practicing, town, would a small child throw rocks at his own mother simply because the masses tell him ‘This is what must be done.’?” are effective and sometimes polished.</p> <p>Stylistic choices as evidenced in “By the simple fact that it acts as both the enabler and as the crime itself, convention is demonstrated as being dangerous due to those who will follow it unquestionably” and “By clinging to a certain ideal and showing hostility towards those who would detract from it, society limits free-thinking and, potentially, improvements in the way the culture acts” contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2007
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Correctness (E)</p> <p>This writing demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</p> <p>The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p>	<p>A sentence such as “The author paints a vivid portrait of a small town where, not only are the conventions of the day followed blindly, there is a hostility felt towards those who would deter from their beliefs and modernize, no matter how rational their reasoning” represents one of many that demonstrate confidence and control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</p> <p>Given the complexity of the response, errors found in sentences such as “Conventions that are taken for granted are challenged and the reader is made reflect on the current balance between respecting history and being able to recognize a poor choice” are forgivable. Overall, the relative absence of errors is impressive.</p>

Scoring Categories and Criteria

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2006–2007 Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Because students' responses to the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt's suggestion:

... the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult's "correct" answer.

Rosenblatt, Louise. "The Reader's Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt." By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins' suggestion that we should assess students' writing "with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student's ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses."

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

Ideas and Impressions (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

Senior High School English Language Arts 2.1 2.2 2.3 4.1

When marking **Ideas and Impressions**, the marker should consider the quality of

- the student's **exploration** of the topic
- the student's **ideas and reflection**
- **support** in relation to the student's ideas and impressions

Excellent

The student's exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student's ideas and impressions.

E

Proficient

The student's exploration of the topic is purposeful. Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. Support is specific and strengthens the student's ideas and impressions.

Pf

Satisfactory

The student's exploration of the topic is generalized. Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant. Support is adequate and clarifies the student's ideas and impressions.

S

Limited

The student's exploration of the topic is vague. Perceptions and/or ideas are superficial and/or ambiguous. Support is imprecise and/or ineffectively related to the student's ideas and impressions.

L

Poor

The student's exploration of the topic is minimal. Perceptions and/or ideas are underdeveloped and/or irrelevant. Support is lacking and/or unrelated to the student's ideas and impressions.

P

Insufficient

Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality. Assign Insufficient when

INS

- the student has responded using a form other than prose **OR**
- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Ideas and Impressions **OR**
- there is no evidence that the topic presented in the assignment has been addressed **OR**
- there is no connection between the text(s) provided in the assignment and the student's response

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2006–2007
Personal Response to
Texts Assignment
(continued)**

Presentation (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

Senior High School English Language Arts 3.1 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Presentation**, the marker should consider the effectiveness of

- **voice** in relation to the context created by the student in the chosen prose form
- **stylistic choices** (including quality of language and expression) and the student's creation of **tone**
- the student's development of a **unifying effect**

Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.

Excellent

E

The voice created by the student is convincing. Stylistic choices are precise and the student's creation of tone is adept. The unifying effect is skillfully developed.

Proficient

Pf

The voice created by the student is distinct. Stylistic choices are specific and the student's creation of tone is competent. The unifying effect is capably developed.

Satisfactory

S

The voice created by the student is apparent. Stylistic choices are adequate and the student's creation of tone is conventional. The unifying effect is appropriately developed.

Limited

L

The voice created by the student is indistinct. Stylistic choices are imprecise and the student's creation of tone is inconsistent. The unifying effect is inadequately developed.

Poor

P

The voice created by the student is obscure. Stylistic choices impede communication and the student's creation of tone is ineffective. A unifying effect is absent.

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2006–2007 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Thought and Understanding (7.5% of total examination mark)
 Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.1 2.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Thought and Understanding**, the marker should consider

- how effectively the student’s **ideas** relate to the assignment
- the quality of the **literary interpretations and understanding**

Because students’ responses to the *Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt’s suggestion:

... the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult’s “correct” answer.

Rosenblatt, Louise. “The Reader’s Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt.” By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins’ suggestion that we should assess students’ writing “with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student’s ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses.”

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

Excellent

E

Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.

Proficient

Pf

Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.

Satisfactory

S

Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are general but plausible.

Limited

L

Ideas are superficial or oversimplified, demonstrating a weak comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are incomplete and/or literal.

Poor

P

Ideas are largely absent or irrelevant, and/or do not develop the topic. Little comprehension of the literary text(s) is demonstrated.

Insufficient

INS

Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality. Assign Insufficient when

- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Thought and Understanding and/or Supporting Evidence **OR**
- no reference has been made to literature studied **OR**
- the only literary reference present is to the text(s) provided in the first assignment **OR**
- there is no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the task presented in the assignment

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2006–2007
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment
(continued)

Supporting Evidence (7.5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.3 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Supporting Evidence**, the marker should consider

- the **selection** and **quality** of evidence
- how well the supporting evidence is **employed, developed, and synthesized** to support the student’s ideas

Consider ideas presented in the *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)*.

Excellent E	Support is precise, and astutely chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a convincing way. A valid connection to the student’s ideas is efficiently maintained.
Proficient Pf	Support is specific, and well chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a persuasive way. A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained.
Satisfactory S	Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness. A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained.
Limited L	Support is inadequate, inaccurate, largely a restatement of what was read, and/or inappropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas and thus lacks persuasiveness. A weak connection to the student’s ideas is maintained.
Poor P	Support is irrelevant, overgeneralized, lacks validity, and/or is absent. Little or no connection to the student’s ideas is evident.

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2006–2007
Critical/Analytical
Response to Literary
Texts Assignment
(continued)**

Form and Structure (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for
Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.2 3.1 4.1 4.2

When marking **Form and Structure**, the marker should consider how effectively the student’s organizational choices result in

- a **coherent, focused, and shaped** arrangement and discussion in response to the assignment
- a **unifying effect** or a **controlling idea** that is developed and maintained

Excellent E	A judicious arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully. The unifying effect or controlling idea is effectively sustained and integrated.
Proficient Pf	A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably. The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.
Satisfactory S	A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately. The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.
Limited L	A discernible but ineffectual arrangement of ideas and details provides some direction for the discussion that is underdeveloped. A unifying effect or controlling idea is inconsistently maintained.
Poor P	A haphazard arrangement of ideas and details provides little or no direction for the discussion, and development is lacking or obscure. A unifying effect or controlling idea is absent.

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2006–2007
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment
(continued)

Matters of Choice (5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Choice**, the marker should consider how effectively the student's choices enhance communication. The marker should consider

- **diction**
- choices of **syntactic structures** (such as parallelism, balance, inversion)
- the extent to which **stylistic choices** contribute to the creation of **voice**

Excellent
E Diction is precise. Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice.

Proficient
Pf Diction is specific. Syntactic structures are generally effective. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice.

Satisfactory
S Diction is adequate. Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.

Limited
L Diction is imprecise and/or inappropriate. Syntactic structures are frequently awkward or ambiguous. Inadequate language choices contribute to the creation of a vague composition with an undiscerning voice.

Poor
P Diction is overgeneralized and/or inaccurate. Syntactic structures are uncontrolled or unintelligible. A lack of language choices contributes to the creation of a confused composition with an ineffective voice.

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2006–2007 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment (continued)

Matters of Correctness (5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Correctness**, the marker should consider the correctness of

- **sentence construction** (completeness, consistency, subordination, coordination, predication)
- **usage** (accurate use of words according to convention and meaning)
- **grammar** (subject-verb/pronoun-antecedent agreement, pronoun reference, consistency of tense)
- **mechanics** (punctuation, spelling, capitalization)

Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.

Excellent
E This writing demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.

Proficient
Pf This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.

Satisfactory
S This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear.

Limited
L This writing demonstrates faltering control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The range of errors blurs the clarity of communication.

Poor
P This writing demonstrates lack of control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Jarring errors impair communication.