

# Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing

# English Language Arts 30–1

From the January 2010 Diploma Examination

- Personal Response to Texts Assignment
- Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Government  
of Alberta ■

Alberta ■

Freedom To Create. Spirit To Achieve.

This document was written primarily for:

Students	✓
Teachers	✓
Administrators	✓
Parents	✓
General Public	✓
Others	

Copyright 2010, the Crown in Right of Alberta, as represented by the Minister of Education, Alberta Education, Learner Assessment, 44 Capital Boulevard, 10044 108 Street NW, Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6, and its licensors. All rights reserved.

**Special permission** is granted to **Alberta educators only** to reproduce, for educational purposes and on a non-profit basis, parts of this document that do **not** contain excerpted material.

Excerpted material in this document **shall not** be reproduced without the written permission of the original publisher (see credits, where applicable).

## *Contents*

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010</b>	
<b>Writing Assignments</b>	<b>3</b>
Personal Response to Texts Assignment	<b>4</b>
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment	<b>10</b>
<b>English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response</b>	
<b>Standards Confirmation</b>	<b>12</b>
Background	<b>12</b>
Impressions from Standards Confirmation January 2010	<b>13</b>
<b>Examples of Students’ Writing with Teachers’ Commentaries</b>	<b>15</b>
English Language Arts 30–1 Personal Response to Texts Assignment, January 2010	<b>15</b>
English Language Arts 30–1 Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, January 2010	<b>35</b>
<b>Scoring Categories and Criteria</b>	<b>57</b>

## *Acknowledgements*

Publication of this document would not have been possible without the permission of the students whose writing is presented. The co-operation of these students has allowed us to continue illustrating the standards of writing performance expected in the context of diploma examinations and demonstrate the variety of approaches taken by students in their writing.

This document includes the valuable contributions of many educators. Sincere thanks and appreciation are extended to the following Standards Confirmers: Rhonda Anderson-Steffes, Laurie Chomany, Monica Gackle, Colleen Hetherington, Gary Hoogers, Stefan Johnson, Janine Metzner Huizing, and Christine Neddoly.

We gratefully acknowledge the contributions made by members of the Humanities Unit and the Document Design and Desktop Publishing Unit of Learner Assessment, Alberta Education.

You can reach us with your comments and questions by e-mail to [Barbara.Proctor-Hartley@gov.ab.ca](mailto:Barbara.Proctor-Hartley@gov.ab.ca), [Heather.Wheatland@gov.ab.ca](mailto:Heather.Wheatland@gov.ab.ca), or [Tim.Coates@gov.ab.ca](mailto:Tim.Coates@gov.ab.ca), or by regular mail at

Alberta Education  
Box 43  
44 Capital Boulevard  
10044 108 Street NW  
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6

We would be pleased to hear from you.

## *Introduction*

The written responses in this document are examples of English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination writing that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), or Excellent (E). These sample responses are taken from the January 2010 administration. Along with the commentaries that accompany them, they should help you and your students to understand the standards for English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination writing in relation to the scoring criteria.

The purpose of the sample responses is to illustrate the standards that governed the January 2010 marking session. The sample papers and the commentaries were used to train markers to apply the scoring criteria consistently and to justify their decisions about scores in terms of each student’s work and the criteria.

The sample responses included in this document represent a very small sample of successful approaches to the assignments.

## *Selection and Use of Sample Papers*

The teachers on the Standards Confirmation Committee for the January 2010 marking session selected the examples of student responses included here. They also wrote the commentaries that discuss the students’ writing in terms of the scoring criteria used for marking.

During their preparation for the January 2010 marking session, markers reviewed and validated the standards represented by these sample responses. Markers then used these sample responses as guidelines for marking the written-response sections of the January 2010 English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination.

## *Cautions*

### **1. The commentaries are brief.**

The commentaries were written for groups of markers to discuss and apply during the marking session. Although brief, they provide a model for relating specific examples from student work to the details in a specific scoring criterion.

### **2. Neither the scoring guide nor the assignments are meant to limit students to a single organizational or rhetorical approach in completing any diploma examination assignment.**

Students must be free to select and organize their materials in a manner that they feel will enable them to best present their ideas. In fact, part of what is being assessed is the final effectiveness of the content, the form and structure, and the rhetorical choices that students make.

The student writing in this document illustrates *just a few of the many* successful organizational and rhetorical strategies used in January 2010.

We strongly recommend that you caution your students that there is *no preferred approach* to an assignment except the approach that best accomplishes the student writer's goal of effectively communicating his or her own ideas about the topic.

We advise you not to draw any conclusions about common patterns of approach taken by students.

**3. The sample papers presented in this document must not be used as models for instructional purposes.**

Because these papers are illustrations only, and because they are sample responses to a set topic, students must be cautioned not to memorize the content of any of these assignments or to use them when completing classroom assignments or when writing future diploma examinations.

The *approaches* taken by students at the *standard of excellence*, not their words or ideas, are what students being examined in the future should consider emulating. In fact, it is hoped that the variety of approaches presented here will inspire students to experiment with diction, syntax, form, and structure as a way of developing an individual voice and engaging the reader in ideas and forms that the student has considered.

Examination markers and staff at Alberta Education take any possibility of plagiarism or cheating seriously. The consequences for students are grave.

**4. It is essential that you consider each of these examples of student writing in light of the constraints of the examination situation.**

Under examination conditions, students produce *first-draft writing*. Given more time, students would be expected to produce papers of considerably improved quality, particularly in the dimensions of Presentation, Matters of Correctness, and Writing Skills.

**5. For further information regarding student performance on the Part A: Written Response, access the **English Language Arts 30–1 Assessment Highlights** for January and June 2009.**

*English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010*  
*Writing Assignments*

*January 2010*

***English Language Arts 30–1***  
***Part A: Written Response***

*Grade 12 Diploma Examination*

***Description***

**Time: 2½ hours.** This examination was developed to be completed in 2½ hours; however, you may take an additional ½ hour to complete the examination.

Plan your time carefully.

**Part A: Written Response** contributes 50% of the total English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination mark and consists of two assignments.

- **Personal Response to Texts Assignment**  
*Value 20% of total examination mark*
- **Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**  
*Value 30% of total examination mark*

**Recommendation:** Read and reflect upon the whole examination before you begin to write. Time spent in planning may result in better writing.

***Do not write your name anywhere in this booklet. Feel free to make corrections and revisions directly on your written work.***

***Instructions***

- Complete the Personal Response to Texts Assignment first. The Personal Response to Texts Assignment is designed to allow you time to think and reflect upon the ideas that you may also explore in the Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment.
- Complete **both** assignments.
- You may use the following print references:
  - an English and/or bilingual dictionary
  - a thesaurus
  - an authorized writing handbook
- Space is provided in this booklet for planning and for your written work.
- Use blue or black ink for your written work.

***Additional Instructions for Students Using Word Processors***

- Format your work using an easy-to-read 12-point or larger font such as Times.
- Double-space your final copy.
- Staple your final printed work to the pages indicated for word-processed work for each assignment. Hand in all work.
- Indicate in the space provided on the back cover that you have attached word-processed pages.

## PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

**Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes**

Carefully read and consider the texts on pages 1 to 4, and then complete the assignment that follows.

### Swing Valley

Oak or elm—I can't see it  
clearly anymore, but it was the tallest thing  
in that hollow, and someone  
always managed to shinny up  
to the farthest branch with the end  
of a tarred rope to knot there.

Swinging out we moved  
from the side of one hill over  
the blind rush of bramble  
to graze the shoulder of the other bank  
and arc back home again.

Summer, winter, summer, of course  
those old ropes rotted now and then,  
and Carvalho rode one to a parting,  
flying down through deep tangles, still  
sitting on the knot, his hands clutching  
the rope as the bitter end  
trailed down like a plume of smoke.

We thought he was all right  
when we heard the bushes moving,  
and he was. The earth still loved us then,  
and the sky watched over us  
just as in those stories we heard  
about the miracles of the saints,

and a few days later we went up  
with another rope, hawked  
from the wharf after dark,  
and one by one we ran it down,  
jumped the knot and swept  
across the hollow,

feeling the release and then the pull  
of what we already carried with us,  
gravity learning the measure  
of that unimagined freight.

*Frank Gaspar*

## from HOME PLACE

It was Gil MacLean's speculation that his son married only to get his hands on land. Not land of Darlene's, she was a waif and a pauper and had none, but his land, Gil MacLean's land. He never entertained the idea that Ronald might have married out of loneliness, or lust, or any feeling of the remotest kin to either. Just land. That was why he was sometimes troubled, wondering what share of responsibility was his to bear for Ronald's current unhappiness. Maybe he ought to have transferred the title sooner, but he had never trusted the boy's judgment. Events appeared to have confirmed his suspicions. Ronald had his own farm now, a wedding present. A married man needed land, so his father gave him the farm that the MacLeans had always called the "home place." It gave Gil satisfaction to see it pass from father to son and he thought it might bring Ronald luck.

The home place consisted of the original quarter Gil's father had homesteaded, the pre-emption, and another 320 acres picked up cheap from a Finnish immigrant who went to pieces when his wife ran off on him. Over the years the MacLean family acquired other holdings but the home place was special. Situated in a valley, it was a mix of rich bottom land and steep, wooded hills. In the spring, down by the river, blizzards of gulls floated in the wake of tractor and disker, pursuing easy pickings, while hawks rode the air high above the lean hills and, shrieking, fell to plunder these lazy storms of white birds. To Gil it had all been beautiful. It was all he had ever wanted, to possess that place and those sights. A day spent away from the farm made him restless, cranky. Returning to it, even after the briefest absence, he acted oddly, dodging through the wires of a fence in his city clothes to wade about in his crop, hands running back and forth lightly over the bearded heads the way another man might absent-mindedly stroke a cat. Or he might suddenly strike off for the hills with all the energy and purpose of someone hurrying off to keep an appointment, tie flying over his shoulder.

His wife used to say: "Gil's gone off to satisfy himself that nobody so much as shifted a cup of dirt on this place when he was away."

What Gil never confided to his wife was that he felt more present in the land than he did in his own flesh, his own body. Apart from it he had no real existence. When he looked in a mirror he stood at a great distance from what he regarded, but with the land it was different. All that he had emptied of himself into it, he recognized.

The road to the home place ran due east without deviating a hair, rising and falling regularly as a sleeper's breath as it made its way over a succession of bare hills. The emerging sun drew his eyes into a squint when he topped a rise; the blue shadows in the hollows forced them wide again. In the back of the truck the slither and clatter of iron shoes was unremitting. The colt was either highly strung or lacked balance. If it lost its footing and fell it would be a task to get on its feet again; the box was narrow and there was little room for manoeuvring. He'd have to go back and get Ronald out of bed to help him.

Turning Ronald out of bed was not an easy job. Despite his son's difficulties falling asleep, once he was gone he wasn't likely to stir. Often he didn't wake before noon. Gil, on the other hand, roused to the slightest sound. That first night the gritty scraping of the shoes on the stairs had been enough to jerk him out of a dreamless sleep. He'd never been

one to lock doors, he had only himself to thank that a night intruder was climbing up to him. It was like the television and its stories of grinning madmen invading houses and arming themselves with drapery cords and butcher knives to strangle and stab. The old man bunched up his pillow and held it out before him, ready to parry the first knife thrust. The footsteps, however, went on past his door. Only when the toilet flushed did he realize it had to be Ronald.

He simply shook in bed for several minutes, too angry and too relieved to ask himself what his son might be up to. Finally he grew calm and curiosity prodded him out into the hallway to investigate. The light was on in Ronald's old bedroom and the door stood ajar.

Ronald was lying flat on his back on the bed, staring up at his model airplanes. As a teenager, even as a young man, he had exhibited little interest in anything other than building models of airplanes from kits, squeezing tubes of glue, pasting on decals, and painting engine cowlings with brushes whose tips he sucked into needle points. The models had never been removed. Forty or more of them hung suspended from the ceiling on fine wires; his room was almost exactly as he had left it when he chose Darlene. Flying Fortresses, Mustangs, Zeros, Spitfires, Messerschmitts, a whole catalogue of war planes dangled there. The light in the bedroom was also as harsh, pitiless, and glaring as it had ever been. When Ronald was fourteen he had unscrewed the bulb in the ceiling fixture and replaced it with a more powerful one. He also dispensed with the shade because he wanted the models hanging beneath the light bulb to cast their shadows on his bedspread and linoleum in the way fighter planes and bombers passing between sun and earth print their images on country lanes and city squares. These shadows were repeated everywhere about the room, and in their midst lay Ronald, gazing up into the strong light, gazing up at undercarriages and silhouettes.

"What's all this, Ronald?" his father said. "This is a hell of a time to pay a visit. It's past two."

Ronald said: "I can't stand it. I can't sleep there no longer." He kept his eyes fixed on the planes as he spoke.

Gil knew there was talk going around town about his son and his daughter-in-law, all of it unfortunate. Darlene had come stamped with the word trouble; he'd seen it from day one. The old man sighed and took a seat on the straight-back chair beside the dresser. Ronald was not exactly the forthcoming type, he was prepared to wait him out.

After a considerable stretch of silence his son said: "I should never have left." Gil knew what he meant. Ronald wasn't saying he ought not to have left Darlene; he was saying he should not have abandoned this room and the comfort and solace of those planes that could not fly.

*Guy Vanderhaeghe*

New York, ca. 1962



© The Estate of Garry Winogrand, courtesy Fraenkel Gallery, San Francisco

*Garry Winogrand*

## **PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT**

**Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes**

You have been provided with three texts on pages 1 to 4. In “Swing Valley,” by Frank Gaspar, the speaker reflects on a time when he and his companions experienced the joy of a momentary release from gravity. In the excerpt from “Home Place,” by Guy Vanderhaeghe, Gil MacLean’s adult son Ronald has returned to the security of the physical space that shaped his youth. Garry Winogrand’s photograph from 1962 captures a moment in a young couple’s visit to the zoo.

### **The Assignment**

**What do these texts suggest to you about the ways in which individuals pursue or compromise their happiness? Support your idea(s) with reference to one or more of the texts presented and to your previous knowledge and / or experience.**

#### **In your writing, you must**

- use a prose form
- connect one or more of the texts provided in this examination to your own ideas and impressions

## Personal Response to Texts Assignment

### *Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

---

---

---

---

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

---

---

---

---

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practiced in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

---

Additional space is provided for planning on other pages in the examination booklet.

**CRITICAL/ANALYTICAL RESPONSE TO LITERARY TEXTS ASSIGNMENT****Suggested time: approximately 1½ to 2 hours**

Do *not* use the texts provided in this booklet for the Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment. Choose from short stories, novels, plays, screenplays, poetry, films, or other literary texts that you have studied in English Language Arts 30–1. When considering the works that you have studied, choose a literary text (or texts) that is meaningful to you and relevant to the following assignment.

**The Assignment**

**Discuss the idea(s) developed by the text creator in your chosen text about the ways in which individuals pursue or compromise their happiness.**

*In your planning and writing, consider the following instructions.*

- Carefully consider your *controlling idea* and how you will create a strong *unifying effect* in your response.
- As you develop your ideas, support them with appropriate, relevant, and meaningful examples from your choice of literary text(s).

## Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

### *Initial Planning*

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and  
Text Creator

---

---

---

---

*Note:* Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

### ***Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text*** **Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes**

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Additional space is provided for *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text* on the following page.

# *English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation*

## *Background*

For all diploma examination scoring sessions, Learner Assessment staff use a process of standards confirmation to establish and illustrate expectations for students' work in relation to the scoring criteria and to ensure scoring consistency within and between marking sessions. Because there are several diploma examination administrations and scoring sessions each school year, the standards must remain consistent for each scoring session in the school year and, similarly, from year to year.

Standards for student achievement start with both the demands of the Program of Studies for senior high school English Language Arts and the interpretation of those demands through learning resources and classroom instruction. These agreed-upon standards are also exemplified in the kinds of tasks and the degree of independence expected of students. All these complex applications of standards precede the design, development, and scoring of each diploma examination.

The Standards Confirmation Committee is composed of experienced teachers from representative regions of the province. These teachers work with the Learner Assessment staff responsible for the development, scoring, and results-reporting for each diploma examination. Teacher-members participate over a two-year period and are required to serve as group leaders or markers during at least one of the subsequent marking sessions.

There are two essential parts to applying standards at the point of examination scoring: the expectations embedded in the scoring criteria and the examples of students' work that illustrate the scoring criteria within each scoring category. The scoring categories and scoring criteria are available to teachers and students via the 2009/2010 English Language Arts 30–1 Information Bulletin. During each of the January and June marking sessions, example papers selected by members of the Standards Confirmation Committee are used to train markers. Subsequent to each marking session, the example papers that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), and Excellent (E) are posted on the Alberta Education website at [education.alberta.ca](http://education.alberta.ca) in the documents entitled Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing.

During the standards confirmation process,

- the appropriateness of the standards set by the examination in relation to students' work is confirmed
- student responses that clearly illustrate the standards in the scoring categories and the scoring criteria are selected and are used when training markers
- rationales that explain and support the selection of sample papers in terms of the scoring categories, scoring criteria, and students' work are written

# *Impressions from Standards Confirmation January 2010*

## *Personal Response to Texts Assignment*

### *Preparing to Mark*

- When marking a response, markers consciously return to the **Focus** section of the scoring criteria to reorient themselves to the distinction between the two scoring categories. Markers take care to read the students' comments in the *Initial Planning* section, wherein students might indicate their reasoning and intention in choosing a particular prose form.
- Markers review the texts provided in the assignment and reread the prompt and assignment at the start of each marking day. Markers expect that the students' ideas and impressions are informed by the details within the text(s) and the contextual information presented in the preamble. Standards Confirmers found that many students employed greater specificity when using details from the text(s) or, alternatively, when "fleshing out" the text(s) with their own imaginative details.

### *Choice of Prose Form*

- Standards Confirmers observed that many students have developed more confidence in dealing with the strengths and constraints of different prose forms and have often opted to use explicit reference to a text or texts within a creative response. When the markers considered the student's creation of **voice**, the focus was on "the context created by the student in the chosen prose form." Markers also carefully considered the effectiveness of "the student's development of a **unifying effect**." These distinctions are especially significant when assessing creative responses.

### *Explicit Reference to Text*

- Standards Confirmers found that students making explicit references to the texts did so with varying degrees of plausibility relative to the historical context established in the response, and that imaginative details that may not have accurately reflected historical fact were understandable. Frequently, markers recognized that, with varying degrees of originality, the fiction created by the students paralleled one or more of the texts provided. Similarity between the premise of the narrative or the students' personal experience and the other texts was understandable given classroom practice and the nature of the assignment.

### *Implicit Reference to Text*

- As in the past, some students did not explicitly support their ideas "with reference to one or more of the texts presented." In some responses, an obvious parallel to the text(s) was apparent, whereas in others, an implicit understanding of and connection to the text(s) were evident in the presentation of ideas. The student's exploration of ideas and impressions, however, must address the question in the assignment, and markers must be able to identify

the student's inferences and the implicit relationship between the topic, the texts, and the student's ideas and support. Standards Confirmers observed that, with varying degrees of success, students have found creative ways of *explicitly* representing the relationship linking topic, text reference, and ideas regardless of the chosen prose form. Standards Confirmers suggested that markers might occasionally need to read a student's work more than once to appreciate what the student has attempted and, in fact, accomplished.

### ***Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment***

- In the Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, students employed a number of approaches to fulfill the assignment. The assignment demanded that students choose their literature judiciously to address the ideas that the text creators develop regarding “the ways in which individuals pursue or compromise their happiness.” Students chose from a wide variety of literary texts, including film, to support their ideas. Where students elected to use more than one text, Standards Confirmers noted that students did so with varying degrees of familiarity and specificity. In these, as in all cases, markers considered the student's treatment of the texts, the selection and quality of evidence, and how well that evidence was integrated and developed to support the student's ideas. Students are strongly encouraged to choose their texts from the approved list for ELA 30–1. Texts which have literary merit and complexity of theme provide students with the opportunity to produce a critical/analytical response containing insight, substance and thoroughness. When students choose texts that have not been studied in depth in the classroom or that lack literary merit and complexity, they reduce their chances of producing a critical/analytical response that will meet the standard for the ELA 30–1 diploma examination.
- Standards Confirmers observed that most students considered the implications of the full assignment and demonstrated an understanding of the ways in which individuals pursue or compromise their happiness. Some students appropriately used a creative approach to organize and express their ideas in a critical and/or analytical manner.

### ***Reminders for Markers***

- Check for the literary text(s) selection in the Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment *before* beginning to mark the paper, especially given the increasing number of new texts appearing in student responses in the examination. Students assume that markers have recently taught the literary text(s).
- Markers must consider the student's comments presented in the Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s) when assessing the scoring category of Supporting Evidence. Some students reveal thoughtful awareness of their purpose in choosing a particular text.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

*Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

Home Place Ronald gives up his happiness so  
that he might have land

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

How a writer compromises his story and  
happiness so that he might be rich

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practiced in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Short story

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

The Novel

David Gyre sat uncomfortably in the straight back chair provided to him in the waiting room. He anxiously waited as the clock counted down, the seconds seemed almost to blur into hours then speed away into nothing. His heart was racing and a cold sweat had broken out on the back of his neck. He held in his hands his pride and joy, as novel he had been working on for over three years. David had always been an avid writer; his mother had a tin box full of his stories from kindergarten all the way up to his creative writing courses in college. He was here today to see if Durzo Publications would print his book. The clock struck on with an infuriating “TICK TOCK” that nearly drove him mad, he snuck a glance over at Mr. Durzo's secretary hoping she would notice and give him some clue as to how much time was left. Almost reading his thoughts she turned over said for him to enter and that Mr. Durzo would see him now. He walked past her desk and into the doorway of new beginnings.

He found a leather chair and seated himself in front of the desk waiting to talk in till spoken to.

“It's good kid. Real good.” Mr. Durzo said from behind the haze of his Cigar.

“I'm glad you like it sir I've worked very hard on this it's always been my dream to have something of mine published.” said David in a meek voice.

“There's just one thing,” Mr. Durzo paused taking another puff from his cigar.

“Umm... what is that Mr. Durzo?”

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

“ We Just need you to make a few changes before we can publish”. Stupid out of his mind in wonderment that his book could be published, David hastily returned home to begin work on the corrections Mr. Durzo had ordered.

As he read over he changes he'd made in his book, David began to realize that this new book was not his own. The “changes” Mr. Durzo had ordered robbed his story of soul and it crippled the emotions of his characters. The more he read the revisions the more he began to feel like this wasn't his book and it wasn't what he'd planned. His hope had been to have his book published and with these revisions it felt to him that his book really wouldn't be published, that his story would be stuck in his head and first drafts alone. He needed to talk to Mr. Durzo and ask him why he had advised to destroy his story.

David arrived in the waiting room of Mr. Durzo once again sweating, but this time he was sweating from the twelve blocks he ran to get there. He marched past Durzo's secretary ignoring her cries that he didn't have an appointment and tramped through the door. “Mr. Durzo I have to ask why did you demand these changes? They rob the essence of my novel.” David declared aloud  
“Listen Kid, I'll be straight with you, we asked for the changes so that we could sell your book to a bigger demographic. Your old story was great. But... it was too complex for most of today's modern readers. Sure you book may have inspired some people and there would have been plenty of people who bought it, but it wouldn't sell to today's more laymen population. That's were the money is; those changes help to give your book a

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

bigger audience. Now let me ask you do you want your book to be published with the changes and become rich, or do you want to keep your first draft and take it somewhere else?"....

David Gyres book is a top seller; its endorsed by the Oprah Book club and remained at the top of the New York Best seller list for three consecutive months after its initial release. David became rich off of his book, writing several follow-ups to his first book. But despite his newfound riches and fame, David Gyre is at heart a miserable man; he compromised his happiness to publish a book that was never truly his. And every day David can't help but think, "*I should have left. I should have walked out the door when I had the chance.*

**English Language Arts 30–1 January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is generalized.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant.</li> <li>• Support is adequate and clarifies the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul>	<p>The student’s <b>exploration of the topic</b> through a creative narrative about the dilemma a young author faces when he tries to get his first novel published is <b>generalized</b>: “he compromised his happiness to publish a book that was never truly his.” The connection to the topic of pursuing happiness is <b>straightforward</b>: “He held in his hands his pride and joy, as novel he had been working on for over three years” and “David had always been an avid writer.” David asserts what he believes will make him happy when he tells Mr. Durzo that “‘it’s always been my dream to have something of mine published.’”</p> <p>The student’s <b>ideas</b> are <b>straightforward</b> as in “Stupid out of his mind in wonderment that his book could be published, David hastily returned home to begin work on the corrections Mr. Durzo had ordered” and “he began to feel like this wasn’t his book and it wasn’t what he’d planned.” The <b>perception</b> that money does not buy happiness—“despite his newfound riches, David Gyre is at heart a miserable man.”—is a common belief and <b>relevant</b> to the narrative.</p> <p><b>Support is adequate in clarifying the student’s ideas.</b> Through the comments of Mr. Durzo, the student clarifies how David is tempted to compromise his happiness for the sake of success: “‘That’s were the money is; those changes help to give your book a bigger audience’” and “‘Now let me ask you do you want your book to be published with the changes and become rich, or do you want to keep your first draft and take it somewhere else?...’” The student provides <b>adequate support</b> for David’s success by noting that his “book is a top seller; its endorsed by the Oprah Book club and remained at the top of the New York Best seller list for three consecutive months.” Support for David’s recognition of his fatal compromise, however, is undercut when the narrator notes that David wrote “several follow-ups to his first book.”</p>

S

**English Language Arts 30–1 January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is apparent.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are adequate and the student’s creation of tone is conventional.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is appropriately developed.</li> </ul>	<p>Early in the response, <b>the voice created by the student is apparent</b>: “his mother had a tin box full of his stories from kindergarten,” “He found a leather chair and seated himself in front of the desk waiting to talk in till spoken to,” “it crippled the emotions of his characters,” “he was sweating from the twelve blocks he ran to get there,” and “‘Sure you book may have inspired some people.’” The student attempts to present the narrative through the limited omniscient point of view; however, the final paragraph advances in time somewhat abruptly and switches to a more fully omniscient point of view with a neutral <b>voice</b>: “David Gyre’s book is a top seller” and “David became rich off of his book.”</p> <p><b>Stylistic choices are adequate</b>: “His heart was racing,” “his pride and joy,” “I’ve worked very hard on this,” “David declared aloud.” An <b>adequate</b> facility with language is demonstrated in the repetition of “sweat” and “sweating” and “robbed” and “rob” and the use of phrases such as “give him some clue” and “stuck in his head.” The similarity between David’s internal reflections and his interaction with Mr. Durzo demonstrates a <b>conventional</b> if consistent <b>tone</b>: “He needed to talk to Mr. Durzo and ask him why he had advised to destroy his story” and “‘Mr. Durzo I have to ask why did you demand these changes? They rob the essence of my novel.’”</p> <p>The references to David’s desire to have his novel published and having to compromise his values and happiness <b>develop the unifying effect</b> in an <b>appropriate</b> way. As well, his final recognition that he regrets his decision, “I should have walked out the door when I had the chance,” brings the narrative to an <b>appropriate</b> conclusion. The acceptable connection to the text is apparent in the adaptation of the line from Home Place in David’s thought, “I should have left.”</p>

S

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**Example Scored Proficient (Pf)**

This example (page 21) is unavailable for posting.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

*Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

In Home Place Ronald left his home/father to marry out of loneliness, not realizing that in doing so he was compromising the happiness that comes with security

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

How an individual's attempt to pursue happiness causes them to lose the joy they already get from life, the pursuit of happiness is futile & will compromise the pleasure they already get from life

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practiced in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

---

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent-1 (E)

- ronald - lonely, trouble sleeping, father too caught up in the land to pay attention
- left what he thought was an intolerable situation, only to realize that Clarence could not offer him the joy + security that he had with the consistency of his room, the beauty of his unchanging model airplanes
  - his pursuit of happiness through reaching out to another person ended up compromising the joy of creation that is his true passion

Most of us do this to some extent, searching to pursue possessions or companionship, the things we believe will make us happy, disregarding or neglecting to think about the less materialistic or commonplace possessions or activities which already give us joy

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

## The Impossible Search

~~In what ways to individuals pursue/compromise their happiness~~

An unhappy man, Ronald MacLean of Guy Vanderhaeghe's "Home Place" is involved in the pursuit of the most elusive emotion, joy. Contentment is a difficult emotion, once it is perceived, it fades back into the mists of dull oppression, leaving the searcher destitute. Ronald MacLean knows this. Growing up with a father too wrapped in the land to understand his passions, he pursued what ought to make him content, companionship in the form of the pauper who became his wife. However his hunt for joy was futile, bringing him back to the place, which for so long he had sought to escape. Ronald's pursuit of happiness ended up compromising any satisfaction he received from the joy of creating model airplanes, his true passion.

For Ronald, bliss is seemingly unattainable; his retreat in youth to a secure and controlled life in miniature afforded him an escape from loneliness but left him incapable of distinguishing his true joy from what he thought he should love. Unable to recognise the joys that his creations, printing their silhouettes over his walls and body, brought him, he left-seeking his brief fix in the arms of a woman, as men are expected to do. However, pursuing what was expected of him, and only attaining that which others believed would make him happy, destroyed his chance at delight. His father believes he married for the acquisition of land, though from childhood Ronald has retreated from involvement in a farming lifestyle. Others think that Ronald married out of loneliness, or lust, but quick passions are not meant to last, and the imagined exhilaration of attaining what ought to make him happy, was lost as his lust was sated. Absorbed in an elusive hunt for joy, Ronald is unable to distinguish his fleeting passions from the happiness afforded by the security and meticulous control that his room demonstrates. Control over both his life and his creations, is demonstrated in the unchanged room, that he never should have left for Darlene. Chasing companionship as a cousin to contentment, Ronald compromises his happiness, his

(Page 3 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

extensive search for what should make him happy rendering him unable to see what truly gives him joy.

Materialistic and shallow, our quickly moving society resembles Ronald's frantic search for the joy that we are all supposed to find with our next wife, or our new bag. The frenzied nature of our culture pushed us towards material acquisitions, or meaningless and lustful relationships, promising that each will improve or enrich our life, making it more convenient for us to enjoy our other possessions and interests while still experiencing the full range of possibilities that advertising has to offer. This is a shallow pursuit, as any deliberate pursuit of happiness is, and significantly lowers the chance of finding contentment. True joy is found, not through searching, purchasing, or networking, but through the recognition of what means most to us, the acceptance and concentration on our individual interests, not our individual possessions. Though many couples say that family and children are the most important part of their lives, the divorce rate is climbing, as families break apart and couples trade up for the newer, younger models which they believe will enhance their personal satisfaction. The shallowness of our culture make the recognised pursuit of happiness futile, and compromises the real joys of life, simple time spent on doing what you love, whether it is making model airplanes or going on solitary walks along the beach. Individuals cannot pursue happiness, it is not a possession that can be found, or a relationship which can be forced into something that doesn't exist, happiness is something that you stumble upon and refuse to give up, a treasure in the sand. The methods with which individuals search for happiness compromises the delights that they already possess.

Ronald pursues what he believes will satisfy him, as do most of us, whether it is something advertising has whispered in our ear, or a personal conviction that the only way to escape loneliness is to have a wife. Darlene, the result of his pursuits, ends up ruining any joy he

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)**

**found in their union until he ‘can’t sleep there no longer’ and realizes that he ‘should never have left’. Too late Ronald discovers that the pursuit of happiness compromises true joy and that he would have been happier if he had remained in the harshly lit confines of his childhood room, the last place in which he pursued something which truly made him happy,.**

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning.</li> <li>• Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul> <p align="center"><b>E</b></p>	<p>On the planning page, the student offers the <b>insightful</b> premise that the pursuit of happiness is futile because it jeopardizes present joys: “an individual’s attempt to pursue happiness causes them to lose the joy they already get from life.” With this starting point, the student goes on to examine Ronald from “Home Place” and the irony that “his hunt for joy was futile, bringing him back to the place, which for so long he had sought to escape. Ronald’s pursuit of happiness ended up compromising any satisfaction he received from the joy of creating model airplanes, his true passion.” By suggesting that the very pursuit of happiness is compromising, evident in Ronald in particular and in North American culture at large, the student offers an <b>insightful</b> and stimulating <b>exploration of the topic</b>.</p> <p>The student’s <b>perception</b> that Ronald is unable to recognize his true joy <b>is discerning</b>: “his retreat in youth to a secure and controlled life in miniature afforded him an escape from loneliness but left him incapable of distinguishing his true joy from what he thought he should love.” The student sees Ronald’s marriage to Darlene as a social imperative, something that “men are expected to do,” but Ronald’s pursuit of this socially accepted happiness “destroyed his chance at delight,” the delight “afforded by the security and meticulous control” of his childhood room. Even though Ronald returns to his room, the student implies that the joy that the room and the model planes once provided has now been compromised. Having assessed Ronald’s error of judgment, the student shifts in the second body paragraph to a confident and telling examination of the “frenzied nature of our culture” that pushes us to pursue happiness as consumers purchase products, searching “for the joy that we are all supposed to find with our next wife, or our new bag.” In this analysis, the student comes to the perceptive conclusion that happiness cannot be pursued consciously or deliberately; rather, “happiness is something you stumble upon and refuse to give up, a treasure in the sand.”</p> <p><b>Support</b>, whether referring to Ronald or to contemporary people who confuse relationships with possessions, <b>is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is convincing.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is skillfully developed.</li> </ul> <p align="center"><b>E</b></p>	<p><b>The voice created by the student is convincing</b> as in “Growing up with a father too wrapped in the land to understand his passions, he pursued what ought to make him content, companionship in the form of a pauper who became his wife,” “Chasing companionship as a cousin to contentment, Ronald compromises his happiness, his extensive search for what should make him happy rendering him unable to see what truly gives him joy,” and “Ronald pursues what he believes will satisfy him, as do most of us, whether it is something advertising whispers in our ear, or a personal conviction that the only way to escape loneliness is to have a wife.”</p> <p><b>Stylistic choices are precise</b> as in “For Ronald, bliss is seemingly unattainable,” “Unable to recognise the joys that his creations, printing their silhouettes over his walls and body, brought him, he left-seeking his brief fix in the arms of a woman,” and “Darlene, the result of his pursuits, ends up ruining any joy he found in their union until he ‘can’t sleep there no longer’ and realizes that he ‘should never have left.’” <b>The student’s creation of tone is adept</b> and confident as in “Others think that Ronald married out of loneliness or lust, but quick passions are not meant to last” and “This is a shallow pursuit, as any deliberate pursuit of happiness is.”</p> <p>The <b>student skillfully develops a unifying effect</b> by analyzing closely Ronald’s misguided and fruitless quest for joy and using that analysis as a jumping-off point for a pointed philosophical examination of modern culture. The student’s critique of those who seek happiness in a calculated way returns, in the conclusion, to Ronald and the sombre assessment that Ronald “would have been happier if he had remained in the harshly lit confines of his childhood room.”</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

*Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

Swing Valley by Frank Gaspar  
The connection is through parallels created between  
the poem and the incident

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

The idea to be explored is the happiness associated  
with Nostalgia and how some people use the  
Past to find happiness in their present.

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practiced in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Reflective short story.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

**Oak or elm—I can't see it**

*Good Copy*

**clearly anymore**

The stresses of high school have a way of getting a person down; I had found this out a few weeks ago as the impending troubles of exams, courses, university applications, a part time job and a social life were proving much more difficult than originally assumed. In an attempt to clear my head, I decided to go for a walk. My wanderings eventually led me to the only spot that made sense. Hidden away in the thick woods that envelop my town was a small clearing that you wouldn't be able to find unless you were looking for it. Here, I found myself longing for the time when the only thing to worry about was whether or not your mother would let you stay out past dark, and when life changing decisions were made by *Bubble gum, bubble gum, in a dish...*

The fallen tree in the Secret Spot had conveniently been ripped out of the ground in such a way that it's roots curled up and around, forming a fort about large enough for four eight-year-olds and the dog we snuck out of the backyard when mom wasn't looking. Days in the fort were spent concocting mystical worlds and fabulous situations, the fort becoming a magical castle, a secret headquarters for super spies, and in more than one situation a literal cover from the rain or snow.

**Summer, winter, summer of course**

That little hidden world became a sanctuary, regardless of the weather. When the snowplow cleared away the heavy snow in the winter months, it would create a towering mountain at the end of the cul-de-sac where I grew up. If you stood at the top of these mountains, you could almost look down directly into the Secret Spot, a fact we of the

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

Secret Spot Society discovered quickly. These snowy mountain peaks became a new hideaway during the winter; they blocked off any possible outside access to the Spot, and if anyone tried to climb to the peak to keep an eye on us, well, that was what snowballs were for.

As winter faded into spring, the creek that snaked its way through the woods would slowly but surely begin to thaw. An infinite number of crossing places would melt away into a miniscule number, prompting the addition of more methods as the seasons continued to change. Children became engineers and architects, crafting bridges out of sticks and debris, fashioning swings out of tattered and frayed ropes. To get to the secret spot directly from the hill leading up to the cul-de-sac, a thick slab of concrete—the kind one finds in parking lots to mark the end of a space—had somehow managed to find its self lodged into the loamy earth at the bottom of the hill. From that spot, one could very easily use it as a launching point to propel themselves across the ravishing waters of the creek below to land on the bank of the Secret Spot.

**We thought he was all right  
when we heard the bushes moving**

My mother found herself greatly concerned with the potential dangers of the Secret Spot, warning us every day that the ground around it was eroded by the creek, that the trees were the places madmen and murderers could easily hide. Such information only began to matter when one particularly perilous journey began, when my friend and I dropped a plastic fish into the creek to chase it down the length. We'd never imagined that my mother's warnings of eroded ground could have any bearing, and when my friend

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

slipped on the half frozen ground and took a tumble into the water, I hardly expected more ground to give way underneath me when I reached to grab her. The pair of us gripped tight onto a thin, worn tree root as though we were about to be swept into the crashing waters of the angry ocean (the three inch tall waterfall less than a few feet down the creek a dangerous enemy) and cried for help. It took us about twenty minutes to realize if I let go of the root we would not be sucked into a vortex...but the moment of dire childhood fear was there, as was the vicious chastising that came with getting our snowsuits soaked by the putrid water of the creek.

**gravity learning the measure  
of that unimagined freight**

I stood amongst the trees in what remained of the Secret Spot. The concrete block had long since been washed away, the dead tree that had created a safe spot to wait out storms and pirate attacks had rotted and collapsed. Looking back now, as much as I'd like to say the adventures of the Secret Spot Society were just the whimsical adventures of a group of children, they defined me and the rest of the people who once played there. The Secret Spot was pure happiness. It was everything large governments fight wars to obtain, epitomized in a tiny dead tree that gave its life for the sake of play. Maybe, I thought as I jumped the creek and landed on a chunk of earth that looked as though it might erode under my feet, that happiness was all simplicity. Maybe it was just the simplicity of a Secret Spot, and a rope swing.

(Page 4 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning.</li> <li>• Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">E</p>	<p>As identified on the planning page, the student creates a sophisticated parallel between the poem and the fictional incident in the reflective short story, which provides an <b>insightful exploration of the topic</b> through the controlling idea that “the happiness associated with nostalgia” can lead individuals to “use the past to find happiness in their present.” The <b>discerning</b> movement through “nostalgia” leads to the <b>insightful</b> recognition that specific memories of the past, both positive and negative, lead to the possibility of finding “pure happiness” in the stressful present. The student develops a key metaphor, “the Secret Spot,” to communicate the <b>discerning perception</b> that “as much as I’d like to say the adventures of the Secret Spot Society were just the whimsical adventures of a group of children, they defined me and the rest of the people who once played there. The Secret Spot was pure happiness.” These were not just moments of carefree childhood joy but experiences that provided perspective that sustains them through life’s complexity.</p> <p>To define “pure happiness,” the student uses <b>precise support</b> to <b>aptly reinforce</b> the different attributes and experiences of the Secret Spot. This place introduces the children to the wonders of the “magical castle,” and also encourages their pragmatic endeavours as “engineers and architects, crafting bridges out of sticks and debris, fashioning swings out of tattered and frayed ropes” to solve the challenge of how to access the Secret Spot during the spring thaw. The narrator also acknowledges that the Secret Spot is a place of “potential dangers” as the mother feared. The student confidently develops the metaphor of the tree to demonstrate that, despite the increasing complexity of life, “pure happiness” is still attainable but it requires sacrifice. The “fallen tree” which initially becomes “a fort,” both magical and pragmatic, becomes “a thin, worn tree root” which averts tragedy and sees the children through “dire childhood fear.” This “dead tree that had created a safe spot to wait out storms and pirate attacks,” despite its decay, provides the <b>insightful perception</b> that childhood experiences define who we are thus giving us the confidence to face the perils of “large governments” and the means to achieve happiness in adulthood. We are sustained by such things as the “the simplicity of a Secret Spot, and a rope swing.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Personal Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is convincing.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is skillfully developed.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold; margin-top: 20px;">E</p>	<p>Through the first person narrator, the student creates a <b>convincing voice</b> that evolves from typical teenage angst bemoaning the “stresses of high school” and “longing for the time when the only thing to worry about was whether or not your mother would let you stay out past dark” to a mature perspective on life that recognizes that these childhood adventures “defined me and the rest of the people who once played there.”</p> <p><b>Precise stylistic choices</b> as in the rhyme “<i>Bubble gum, bubble gum, in a dish</i>” and in the hyperbole of “secret headquarters for super spies” reinforce the child-like tone captured in the nostalgic memories. The <b>tone</b> of the narrator’s mature voice <b>adeptly</b> weaves throughout the narrative as is evident in “As winter faded into spring, the creek that snaked its way through the woods would slowly but surely begin to thaw.” The <b>tone</b> of the mother’s warnings of “madmen and murderers” is convincing especially as it precedes “one particularly perilous journey” wherein the children risked being “sucked into a vortex.” When the narrator returns to the site of the Secret Spot as a young adult, the nostalgic tone is effectively conveyed in “The concrete block had long since been washed away, the dead tree that had created a safe spot to wait out storms and pirate attacks had rotted and collapsed.”</p> <p>The <b>unifying effect</b> is <b>skillfully developed</b> through the student’s deliberate use of quotations from the poem. These quotations serve as quasi-chapter titles directing the reader through the shifts in memory starting with the present time of the “stresses of high school,” shifting to the memories of joyful innocence “concocting mystical worlds and fabulous situations,” moving to memories of “dire childhood fear,” and returning finally to the present, which now contains the possibility of happiness in those aspects of life that are “all simplicity.”</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

*Initial Planning*

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and  
Text Creator

~~Shakespeare's Hamlet by Stephen King~~  
Death of a sales man  
Arthur Miller

**Note:** Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

**Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text**  
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

This text has lots of conflicts where people believe  
with a charm will save them.

Willy - Salesman who compromises his  
happiness by doing something he doesn't love  
BFF - tries to pursue his happiness by being a  
ranch hand but is never truly happy because  
his father is not happy with him.

Happy - compromises his happiness to try and make  
his father happy.

Linda - compromises her happiness to try and  
make Willy feel more loved and appreciated.

(Page 1 of 5)

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

*Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text*

This text has lots of emotional breaking points, lots of conflict and misbeliefs. Willy has not raised Biff and Happy to the best that they could be and Linda did nothing to stop Willy and his ways of teaching the boys these misconceptions and wrong beliefs. Beliefs that popularity & good looks get you through life, not smart and respect.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

The Pursuit of Happiness

Many people often compromise their happiness for the happiness of others or to try and pursue something else that makes them happy. The text *Death of a Salesman* by Arthur Miller is a great example of this. In this text, there are many conflicts that both help pursue and compromise a persons happiness. Willy, is a salesman who lives by the misconception that wit and charm will get you farther in life then knowledge and respect will. Biff, Willys oldest son, went against his fathers wishes and left home to be a ranch hand, but was Willys favorite as a kid. Biff was the star football player, and everybody loved him. Happy is Willys other son, who has tried his entire life to recieve his fathers approval. Happy stayed close to home and got a job in the sales industry just like he thought his father would have wanted.

Willy, has wanted to be a salemans from the time he was very young. He always believed that wit and charm were the key to life, if everybody liked you than you had nothing to worry about. Willy is a failed salesman, who compromised his happiness to try and pursue something he believed would make his happy because it made others happy. In doing this Willy has raised his family under the impression that as long people like you, than you will succeed in everything that you do. Willy is slowly coming to realize that this is not true, as his sales career is slowly circling the drain. Willy has lived under this misconception all his life, because everyone around him that is successful is well liked. Willys misconceptions lost him his sons and his job. Although his sons still love him and care about him and his opinions, they are not happy in the life that they are leading in trying to gain approval from Willy. It wasnt until the day he committed suicide that Willy realized that his way of life was not the only way of life, and gave his respect to his sons.

(Page 3 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Biff, was the football star, most popular guy in school, and was going to go off to university with a football scholarship. However living under the misconceptions of his father, Biff paid more attention to sports and parties and being liked than he did to school and ended up failing his math and not graduating. When Biff went to visit Willy for help to convince him to talk to his teachers about passing him, he came across Willy having an affair. When Biff saw this, he lost respect in his father and the way he was raised. Biff didn't go back and redo his math, he gave up his scholarship and went out to work in the country as a ranch hand. Even though Biff found that working in the country made him happy, he was still not completely satisfied because his father did not approve of his way of life. Willy believed that Biff threw his life away when he gave up being the football star. Biff came home to try again to receive his father's approval, only to find that his father had lost his job, and was getting sick, in that he was starting to hallucinate and talk to himself. Biff tried everything to regain his father's respect, but was still unsuccessful until the day his father committed suicide. That was when his father finally gave his approval. Biff tried to pursue the things that made him happy, but was always compromised by his father's disapproval.

Happy was always second in line, always coming in behind Biff because he was not a sports star, and was not as well liked as Biff was. Happy always had to try harder for his father's attention, and this never went away. Even after Biff left, Happy still felt like he was second in line, so he stayed around home and got a job in the sales industry, thinking that this would help him gain his father's approval. However, Willy was still not impressed with Happy because he wasn't his own boss, he still had people to answer to. So to Willy Happy was still unsuccessful. The entire family wishes to be out of town, live in the country, work with their hands, and be their own person. Yet they are all afraid of what will happen, mostly Happy is afraid of what his father will think. When Happy was younger, he used to lie on his back and pretend to cycle and tell his father that he was losing weight. Happy did this because he felt as

(Page 4 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

though he was never as important and he had to have his father see that he was trying to be just like Biff. Happy compromised his happiness in order to try and keep his father happy.

Many people compromise their happiness for the happiness of others, to pursue something else that they believe will make them happy, or to get them on the path to something that brings them happiness. In the text *Death of a Salesman* by Arthur Miller, we see that people often compromise their own happiness just to be accepted in society, or even in their own families. People need to put themselves first, find what makes them happy, and pursue that. You don't need wit and charm to be successful, you just need common sense, and a little hope.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Thought and Understanding (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic.</li> <li>• Literary interpretations are general but plausible.</li> </ul> <p align="center"><b>S</b></p>	<p>The student offers a <b>straightforward</b> controlling idea that is most clearly expressed in the conclusion: “Many people compromise their happiness for the happiness of others, to pursue something else that they believe will make them happy, or to get them on the path to something that brings them happiness.” Throughout the response, the student examines the “many conflicts that both help pursue and compromise a persons happiness” through the characters of Willy, Biff, and Happy. In doing so, the student demonstrates a <b>generalized comprehension of the text and topic</b>.</p> <p><b>Literary interpretations are general but plausible.</b> The student first identifies that Willy “always believed that wit and charm were the key to life” and he has “lived under this misconception all his life.” The student then moves to a discussion of Biff who “found that working in the country made him happy” but “his father did not approve of his way of life.” Finally the student examines Happy who “stayed around home and got a job in the sales industry, thinking that this would help him gain his fathers approval.” The student’s conclusion that “People need to put themselves first, find what makes them happy, and pursue that” is a <b>general but plausible interpretation</b> of <i>Death of a Salesman</i>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Supporting Evidence (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness.</li> <li>• A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>The student offers <b>general support</b> for Willy’s idea that “wit and charm were the key to life” by stating “if everybody liked you than you had nothing to worry about.” This notion is compromised when “Willy is slowly coming to realize that this is not true.” However, the student’s suggestion that “his sons still love him and care about him and his opinions” <b>lacks persuasiveness</b> as the student offers little evidence of this affection and commitment. The student provides <b>appropriately chosen</b> support when he suggests that Biff lived “under the misconceptions of his father” until he “went out to work in the country as a ranch hand,” but Biff, in turn, compromises his happiness when he “came home to try again to receive his fathers approval.” Happy always “felt like he was second in line,” so he adopts his father’s definition of happiness “thinking that this would help him gain his fathers approval.” The student observes that Happy compromises his own potential for happiness by trying to “keep his father happy.” By commenting that “The entire family wishes to be out of town, work with their hands,” the student overstates the Loman family’s potential for happiness in an attempt to highlight the compromises made. <b>A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained</b> through the discussion of characters who “often compromise their own happiness just to be accepted in society, or even in their own families.”</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Form and Structure (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately.</li><li>• The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.</li></ul> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>S</b></p>	<p>The student offers a <b>straightforward arrangement of ideas and details that provide direction for the discussion</b> of the Lomans’ pursuit of happiness. The student provides the <b>controlling idea</b> that “people often compromise their happiness for the happiness of others” and supports this idea through an <b>appropriately developed discussion</b> of Willy, Biff, and Happy. Although <b>coherence falters</b> somewhat through the inclusion of extraneous details of Biff and Happy’s lives, <b>the unifying effect is presented and maintained generally</b> and concludes appropriately with the summation that “People need to put themselves first, find what makes them happy, and pursue that.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Choice (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Diction is adequate.</li> <li>• Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>The student demonstrates <b>adequate diction</b> in examples such as “In doing this Willy has raised his family under the impression that as long people like you, than you will succeed in everything that you do,” “Biff threw his life away when he gave up being the football star” and “Happy was always second in line.” <b>Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward</b> as in “Biff came home to try again to recieve his fathers approval, only to find that his father had lost his job, and was getting sick, in that he was starting to hallucinate and talk to himself.” <b>Stylistic choices</b> such as “his sales career is slowly circling the drain,” “Biff tried to pursue the things that made him happy, but was always compromised by his fathers disapproval,” and “You dont need wit and charm to be successful, you just need common sense, and a little hope” <b>contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.</b></p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

<b>SCORING CRITERIA</b>	<b>RATIONALE</b>
<p><b>Matters of Correctness (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</li><li>• There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear.</li></ul> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>S</b></p>	<p>The <b>writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics</b> as demonstrated in “Happy stayed close to home and got a job in the sales industry just like he thought his father would have wanted” and “When Biff went to visit Willy for help to convince him to talk to his teachers about passing him, he came across Willy having an affair.” Language choices at times affect the expression of ideas, and there are <b>occasional lapses in control and minor errors</b> as in “When Happy was younger, he used to lie on his back and pretend to cycle and tell his father that he was losing wait”; <b>however, the communication remains clear.</b></p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

*Initial Planning*

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and  
Text Creator

A Doll's House  
— Henrik Ibsen  
— Translated by Poul Fjelde

*Note:* Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

**Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text**  
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

Nora Helmer - is a good wife, provides <sup>for</sup> the family  
however she isn't happy because she has to  
disguise the loan from Torvald and in the end  
sacrifices her home and children for Liberty.  
Torvald Helmer - ~~sacrifices~~ his image and reputation  
for his constant will of being respected by society  
harms his family and his happiness  
Krogstad - is forced to blackmail Nora in  
order to save his family from poverty.

(Page 1 of 6)

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text

⇒ in the end people are lead to sacrifice  
and are forced to ~~to~~ take drastic  
measures in order to ensure their happiness.  
Nora - is black mailed ; does what she is told,  
but that isn't her true nature  
Torvald - enjoys being the dominant one  
in the relationship.

Quotes :

- "but no one gives up honor for love"
- "Millions of women have <sup>love</sup> just that."
- "he would feel humiliated if found out  
that he were to be indebted to me"

1st  
Paragraph  
⇒ Nora's situation  
- the miracle  
- her true feeling  
- of freedom  
2nd = Torvald  
3rd = Krogstad.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

### **The End Justifies the Means**

In order to attain one's happiness, one is often forced to sacrifice and take drastic measures for such a cause. Such is the case in Henrik Ibsen's A Doll's House, translated by Rolf Fjelde, where the characters in his play must undergo an extreme situation that causes each one to reevaluate their idea of happiness. In Ibsen's late 19th century piece, the protagonist, Nora Helmer she is forced to choose between the comfort of her home or the right to her own freedom. Torvald Helmer however, in order to save his marriage and family, he must choose between them or to retain his respected image in society. Furthermore, for the antagonist of the play, Nils Krogstad, he must choose between the security of his children's future or to act upon a villainous deed. Through this, it is evident that Ibsen wishes to show the reality of these complex situations, and what one does in order to preserve one's happiness,

We first learn about Nora's dilemma when she talks to Mrs. Linde and during her encounter with Krogstad that Nora has secretly forged her father's signature in order to take a loan from Nils Krogstad to save Torvald's life. The forgery of one's signature is seen as a crime in society, and furthermore, because it is illegal for Nora to take a loan without the permission of her husband, Nora has committed a serious felony. However, the restrictions of society do not hold Nora back at all because she believes that what she has done has ensured her family's and Torvald's happiness. At first, one's first impression of Nora Helmer is that she is very child-like, and that she enjoys her pampered and restricted life. However, as the play progresses, it is evident that Nora is actually a

(Page 3 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

woman that possesses intelligence and the capability of fending for herself. We learn this after Nora tells Mrs. Linde that she has been taking on copying jobs and saving half of the allowance that Torvald gives her in order to pay off the loan. As the play progresses the following three days become a rude awakening for Nora, as she begins to see that the life that she lives, and the relationship that she has with Torvald is very much like a doll's. It is not until Torvald's violent reaction to reading Krogstad's letter about Nora's crime that Nora finally realizes what she needs to do. Nora's existence in Torvald's home is like a doll's, she does and listens to whatever he tells her to do without any thought. However, Nora realizes this because she even says to Torvald that she has been living in a "stranger's home", and that she has been his "doll-wife" listening to him and adopting his own opinions towards society. Torvald's anger is the catalyst for Nora's departure. Nora realizes that when her miracle didn't happen - Torvald didn't take the blame for her crime - which she has to leave in order to find herself and her own freedom. For Nora, her happiness is her own freedom and individuality. It is evident that Nora realizes that her happiness is greater than her family's but in order to attain that, Nora leaves her children behind and as well has to realize the cruel reality of her relationship with Torvald.

In this play, it is Torvald Helmer that learns that for his superficial happiness, he risks his own true happiness by harming his own family. Torvald Helmer is a man that enjoys being the dominant figure in the relationship and as well believes that his happiness stems from his respected image in the community. However, Torvald becomes a great foil to Nora because in the end, it is he, who is the one that is truly child-like and

(Page 4 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

isn't the intelligent and respected man the he comes across to be. When Torvald instructs Nora how to dance the tarantella, and he teases her with money, or even by calling her his "squirrel" or "little lark", it is evident that Torvald enjoys being the one that is teaching her and being the leading partner. Furthermore, it is Torvald's obsession with his image in society that also leads to the destruction of his true happiness. When Nora begs Torvald not to fire Krogstad from his job, Torvald refuses because he is more afraid that because of Krogstad calling him on a first name basis, and Krogstad's overwhelming familiarity with him, he fears that he will become the "laughing stock" of the bank. In addition to this, when Torvald doesn't allow Nora to raise the children because of her crime, he still insists that she must stay in the household in order for the community to see that they still are a reputable household. It is from Torvald's selfish actions that result in Nora leaving him and as well Torvald ruins his true happiness with his family. However, all is not truly lost with Torvald because at the end of the play when he says to himself, "the greatest miracle-?" It is suggested that Torvald has finally come to realize that in order to gain true happiness he must change his ways.

Nils Krogstad is at first seen as the villain of the play because he is the one that constantly threatens Nora in order for him to keep his job at the bank. However, when one analyzes the situation, Krogstad's situation justifies his actions. He is a man that has been wronged by society and has been fixed with a stigma by society that doesn't allow him to move beyond his past. We learn that like Nora, Krogstad has forged a signature, and because of this is unable to leave the scrutinizing eye of society. It is not only because of this crime that Torvald decides to fire Krogstad, but it is because Krogstad

(Page 5 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

acts too friendly towards Torvald. Krogstad's action threatens Torvald's position in the bank, and so his past and his current actions result in his demise. However Krogstad's actions are understandable because he is forced to save his children from living the same circumstances that he has to face in society because of his crime. Furthermore, Krogstad tells Mrs.Linde - who is now a widower - that his reason for forging the signature is also because she left him for a richer man, instead of marrying him because of love. In the end however, Krogstad is reunited with Mrs. Linde and is able to provide for his children through Mrs.Linde's promotion at the bank. It is from this that we realize that in order for Krogstad to achieve his true happiness, he had to go through rough times and as well take drastic measures to ensure and understand the happiness of his own and of his children.

It is from the characters in Henrik Ibsen's A Doll's House, that one realizes that in the pursuit of happiness it can only be obtained through sacrifice, and drastic measures. For Nora Helmer and Nils Krogstad, they must go through life-changing situations and also sacrifice their loves for their own happiness. For Nora, she sacrificed her relationship with Torvald and children for her freedom. For Krogstad it was his drastic action to threatening Nora in order to protect his children. However, happiness is something that is a need, and is often mistaken for one's desires. That is the case for Torvald when he realizes that his quest for respect in society are his desires that are merely superficial happiness and rather his true happiness lies in his family and his relationship with Nora. Happiness we learn comes with a price, and it is our actions and need for happiness that defines whether or not we are truly happy.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Thought and Understanding (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic.</li> <li>• Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student’s <b>idea</b> that “In order to attain one’s happiness, one is often forced to sacrifice and take drastic measures for such a cause” <b>thoughtfully</b> establishes a <b>competent comprehension</b> of the topic. The characters are forced to make choices: Nora must “choose between the comfort of her home or the right to her own freedom,” Torvald must either choose his family or “retain his respected image in society,” and Krogstad “must choose between the security of his children’s future or to act upon a villainous deed.” <b>Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible</b> as in the assessments that “Nora is actually a woman that possesses intelligence and the capability of fending for herself,” that “Torvald’s anger is the catalyst for Nora’s departure,” that “it is Torvald’s obsession with his image in society that also leads to the destruction of his true happiness” and that Krogstad “has been fixed with a stigma by society that doesn’t allow him to move beyond his past.” Throughout the response, the student presents a <b>considered</b> analysis of the idea that “Ibsen wishes to show the reality of these complex situations, and what one does in order to preserve one’s happiness.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

<b>SCORING CRITERIA</b>	<b>RATIONALE</b>
<p><b>Supporting Evidence (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Support is specific and well chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a persuasive way.</li> <li>• A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p><b>Support is specific and well-chosen</b> in the discussion of each character. Nora takes “a loan without the permission of her husband,” “she enjoys her pampered and restricted life,” “she does and listens to whatever he tells her to do without any thought,” and “Nora realizes that her happiness is greater than her family’s.” That Torvald “enjoys being the dominant figure in the relationship” is demonstrated when he “teases her with money, or even by calling her his ‘squirrel’ or ‘little lark.’” Krogstad’s familiarity with Torvald leads to Torvald’s fear “that he will become the ‘laughing stock’ of the bank,” and “Torvald’s selfish actions” lead to Nora’s departure and to the ruination of “his true happiness with his family.” Because Krogstad “has forged a signature,” he can never escape “the scrutinizing eye of society.” This development of the pattern of choice and consequence in these three characters demonstrates a <b>sound connection to the student’s ideas</b> which is <b>capably maintained</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Form and Structure (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably.</li> <li>• The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;"><b>Pf</b></p>	<p>The student’s development of each character is a <b>purposeful arrangement of ideas and details</b> supporting the <b>controlling idea</b> that “in the pursuit of happiness it can only be obtained through sacrifice, and drastic measures.” Each body paragraph is structured in such a way to examine logically the circumstances, character, and challenges of Nora, Torvald, and Krogstad and the choices they make to pursue or compromise their happiness. <b>The unifying effect is coherently sustained</b> in the concluding sentences of each character discussion which is confidently reinforced in the conclusion that “For Nora Helmer and Nils Krogstad, they must go through life-changing situations and also sacrifice their loves for their own happiness”; however, Torvald realizes, too late, that his “true happiness lies in his family and his relationship with Nora.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Choice (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Diction is specific.</li> <li>• Syntactic structures are generally effective.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p><b>Diction is specific</b> as in “respected image in society,” “villainous deed,” “possesses intelligence and the capability of fending for herself,” “a rude awakening for Nora,” “the scrutinizing eye of society.” The student’s <b>syntactic structures are generally effective</b>: “The forgery of one’s signature is seen as a crime in society, and furthermore, because it is illegal for Nora to take a loan without the permission of her husband, Nora has committed a serious felony,” “Furthermore, Krogstad tells Mrs. Linde – who is now a widower – that his reason for forging the signature is also because she left him for a richer man, instead of marrying him because of love.” These <b>stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a capable voice</b> as demonstrated in such examples as “However, the restrictions of society do not hold Nora back at all because she believes that what she has done has ensured her family’s and Torvald’s happiness,” “she even says to Torvald that she has been living in a ‘stranger’s home’, and that she has been his ‘doll-wife’” and “Furthermore, it is Torvald’s obsession with his image in society that also leads to the destruction of his true happiness.”</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

<b>SCORING CRITERIA</b>	<b>RATIONALE</b>
<p><b>Matters of Correctness (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</li><li>• Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</li></ul> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Pf</b></p>	<p>The student’s <b>writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics</b> as in “As the play progresses the following three days become a rude awakening for Nora, as she begins to see that the life that she lives, and the relationship that she has with Torvald is very much like a doll’s” and “However, Torvald becomes a great foil to Nora because in the end, it is he, who is the one that is truly child-like.” <b>Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable.</b></p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2010**  
**Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**Example Scored Excellent (E)**

This example (page 56) is unavailable for posting.

## Scoring Categories and Criteria

### Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Because students' responses to the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt's suggestion:

*...the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult's "correct" answer.*

Rosenblatt, Louise. "The Reader's Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt." By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins' suggestion that we should assess students' writing "with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student's ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses."

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

**Ideas and Impressions** (10% of total examination mark)  
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.1 2.2 2.3 4.1

When marking **Ideas and Impressions**, the marker should consider the quality of

- the student's **exploration** of the topic
- the student's **ideas and reflection**
- **support** in relation to the student's ideas and impressions

#### **Excellent**

### **E**

The student's exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student's ideas and impressions.

#### **Proficient**

### **Pf**

The student's exploration of the topic is purposeful. Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. Support is specific and strengthens the student's ideas and impressions.

#### **Satisfactory**

### **S**

The student's exploration of the topic is generalized. Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant. Support is adequate and clarifies the student's ideas and impressions.

#### **Limited**

### **L**

The student's exploration of the topic is vague. Perceptions and/or ideas are superficial and/or ambiguous. Support is imprecise and/or ineffectively related to the student's ideas and impressions.

#### **Poor**

### **P**

The student's exploration of the topic is minimal. Perceptions and/or ideas are underdeveloped and/or irrelevant. Support is lacking and/or unrelated to the student's ideas and impressions.

#### **Insufficient**

### **INS**

**Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality.** Assign Insufficient when

- the student has responded using a form other than prose **OR**
- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Ideas and Impressions **OR**
- there is no evidence that the topic presented in the assignment has been addressed **OR**
- there is no connection between the text(s) provided in the assignment and the student's response

**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Personal Response to Texts Assignment (continued)**

**Presentation** (10% of total examination mark)  
 Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 3.1 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Presentation**, the marker should consider the effectiveness of

- **voice** in relation to the context created by the student in the chosen prose form
- **stylistic choices** (including quality of language and expression) and the student’s creation of **tone**
- the student’s development of a **unifying effect**

**Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.**

**Excellent**  
**E** The voice created by the student is convincing. Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept. The unifying effect is skillfully developed.

**Proficient**  
**Pf** The voice created by the student is distinct. Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent. The unifying effect is capably developed.

**Satisfactory**  
**S** The voice created by the student is apparent. Stylistic choices are adequate and the student’s creation of tone is conventional. The unifying effect is appropriately developed.

**Limited**  
**L** The voice created by the student is indistinct. Stylistic choices are imprecise and the student’s creation of tone is inconsistent. The unifying effect is inadequately developed.

**Poor**  
**P** The voice created by the student is obscure. Stylistic choices impede communication and the student’s creation of tone is ineffective. A unifying effect is absent.

**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Critical / Analytical Response to Texts Assignment**

Because students’ responses to the *Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt’s suggestion:

*...the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult’s “correct” answer.*

Rosenblatt, Louise. “The Reader’s Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt.” By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins’ suggestion that we should assess students’ writing “with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student’s ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses.”

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

**Thought and Understanding** (7.5% of total examination mark)  
 Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.1 2.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Thought and Understanding**, the marker should consider

- how effectively the student’s **ideas** relate to the assignment
- the quality of the **literary interpretations** and **understanding**

**Excellent**

**E**

Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.

**Proficient**

**Pf**

Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.

**Satisfactory**

**S**

Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are general but plausible.

**Limited**

**L**

Ideas are superficial or oversimplified, demonstrating a weak comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are incomplete and/or literal.

**Poor**

**P**

Ideas are largely absent or irrelevant, and/or do not develop the topic. Little comprehension of the literary text(s) is demonstrated.

**Insufficient**

**INS**

**Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality.** Assign Insufficient when

- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Thought and Understanding and/or Supporting Evidence **OR**
- no reference has been made to literature studied **OR**
- the only literary reference present is to the text(s) provided in the first assignment **OR**
- there is no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the task presented in the assignment

**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Critical / Analytical Response to Texts Assignment (continued)**

**Supporting Evidence** (7.5% of total examination mark)  
 Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.3 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Supporting Evidence**, the marker should consider

- the **selection** and **quality** of evidence
- how well the supporting evidence is **employed, developed, and synthesized** to support the student’s ideas

**Consider ideas presented in the *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)*.**

<b>Excellent</b> <b>E</b>	Support is precise and astutely chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a convincing way. A valid connection to the student’s ideas is efficiently maintained.
<b>Proficient</b> <b>Pf</b>	Support is specific and well chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a persuasive way. A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained.
<b>Satisfactory</b> <b>S</b>	Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness. A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained.
<b>Limited</b> <b>L</b>	Support is inadequate, inaccurate, largely a restatement of what was read, and/or inappropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas and thus lacks persuasiveness. A weak connection to the student’s ideas is maintained.
<b>Poor</b> <b>P</b>	Support is irrelevant, overgeneralized, lacks validity, and/or is absent. Little or no connection to the student’s ideas is evident.

**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Critical / Analytical Response to Texts Assignment (continued)**

**Form and Structure** (5% of total examination mark)  
 Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.2 3.1 4.1 4.2

When marking **Form and Structure**, the marker should consider how effectively the student’s organizational choices result in

- a **coherent, focused, and shaped** arrangement and discussion in response to the assignment
- a **unifying effect** or a **controlling idea** that is developed and maintained

<b>Excellent</b> <b>E</b>	A judicious arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully. The unifying effect or controlling idea is effectively sustained and integrated.
<b>Proficient</b> <b>Pf</b>	A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably. The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.
<b>Satisfactory</b> <b>S</b>	A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately. The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.
<b>Limited</b> <b>L</b>	A discernible but ineffectual arrangement of ideas and details provides some direction for the discussion that is underdeveloped. A unifying effect or controlling idea is inconsistently maintained.
<b>Poor</b> <b>P</b>	A haphazard arrangement of ideas and details provides little or no direction for the discussion, and development is lacking or obscure. A unifying effect or controlling idea is absent.

**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Critical / Analytical Response to Texts Assignment (continued)**

**Matters of Choice** (5% of total examination mark)  
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Choice**, the marker should consider how effectively the student’s choices enhance communication. The marker should consider

- **diction**
- choices of **syntactic structures** (such as parallelism, balance, inversion)
- the extent to which **stylistic choices** contribute to the creation of **voice**

**Excellent**  
**E** Diction is precise. Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice.

**Proficient**  
**Pf** Diction is specific. Syntactic structures are generally effective. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice

**Satisfactory**  
**S** Diction is adequate. Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.

**Limited**  
**L** Diction is imprecise and/or inappropriate. Syntactic structures are frequently awkward or ambiguous. Inadequate language choices contribute to the creation of a vague composition with an undiscerning voice.

**Poor**  
**P** Diction is overgeneralized and/or inaccurate. Syntactic structures are uncontrolled or unintelligible. A lack of language choices contributes to the creation of a confused composition with an ineffective voice.

**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Critical / Analytical Response to Texts Assignment (continued)**

**Matters of Correctness** (5% of total examination mark)  
 Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Correctness**, the marker should consider the correctness of

- **sentence construction** (completeness, consistency, subordination, coordination, predication)
- **usage** (accurate use of words according to convention and meaning)
- **grammar** (subject-verb/pronoun-antecedent agreement, pronoun reference, consistency of tense)
- **mechanics** (punctuation, spelling, capitalization)

**Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.**

<p><b>Excellent</b> <b>E</b></p>	<p>This writing demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.</p>
<p><b>Proficient</b> <b>Pf</b></p>	<p>This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</p>
<p><b>Satisfactory</b> <b>S</b></p>	<p>This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear.</p>
<p><b>Limited</b> <b>L</b></p>	<p>This writing demonstrates faltering control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The range of errors blurs the clarity of communication.</p>
<p><b>Poor</b> <b>P</b></p>	<p>This writing demonstrates lack of control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Jarring errors impair communication.</p>

